

Discerning the Environmental Perspective of Pope Benedict XVI

Lucia A. Silecchia

Two movements are interacting here. One is that of human beings who do not exploit the world and do not want to detach it from the Creator's governance and make it their own property; rather they recognize it as God's gift and build it up in keeping with what it was created for. Conversely, we see that the world, which was created to be at one with its Lord, is not a threat but a gift and a sign of the saving and unifying goodness of God.¹

I. Introduction

As commentators begin to assess the legacy left behind by Pope John Paul II, they surely will note with interest the contributions that he made to the advancement of Catholic social teaching regarding the necessity for careful stewardship of creation, and the inextricable link that exists between ecological concerns and genuine human development.² The papacy of Pope John Paul II was marked by landmark events in environmental thought including, perhaps most notably, his 1990 Message for the World Day of Peace, his promulgation—with Ecu-

Lucia A. Silecchia is Professor of Law at The Catholic University of America, Columbus School of Law. All of Pope Benedict XVI's papal statements cited in this paper are available on the website of the Holy See, www.vatican.va and are also on file with the author.

¹ JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, "IN THE BEGINNING" . . . A CATHOLIC UNDERSTANDING OF THE STORY OF CREATION AND THE FALL 64-65 (BONIFACE RAMSEY, O.P. TRANS.) (1986) (*hereinafter* "IN THE BEGINNING").

² In an earlier paper, I have discussed the response of Pope John Paul II to ecological concerns, and the many contributions that he made to the development of modern Catholic social teaching in this area. See generally Lucia A. Silecchia, *Environmental Ethics from the Perspectives of NEPA and Catholic Social Teaching: Ecological Guidance for the 21st Century*, 28 WILLIAM & MARY ENVTL. L. & POL'Y REV. 659, 690-723 (2004). Much of the discussion in Section II, below, is derived from this work. For additional reflections on Pope John Paul II's contribution to this area and, more generally, on Catholic teaching on ecological matters, see also CHARLES M. MURPHY, AT HOME ON EARTH: FOUNDATIONS FOR A CATHOLIC ETHIC OF THE ENVIRONMENT 106-27 (1989); MARJORIE KEENAN, FROM STOCKHOLM TO JOHANNESBURG: AN HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE CONCERN OF THE HOLY SEE FOR THE ENVIRONMENT 1972-2002 (2002); JOHN HART, *Care for Creation: Catholic Social Teaching on the Environment*, 9 JOSEPHINUM J. OF THEOLOGY 120 (2002); MAURA A. RYAN & TODD DAVID WHITMORE, EDS. THE CHALLENGE OF GLOBAL STEWARDSHIP: ROMAN CATHOLIC RESPONSES (1997); Robert W. Lannon, *Catholic Tradition and the New Catholic Theology and Social Teaching on the Environment*, 39 CATH. LAW.

menical Patriarch Bartholomew I—of the *Common Declaration on Environmental Ethics* in 2002, and the forceful intervention of the Vatican in international conferences and conventions concerning the environment and international development. Although environmental problems clearly existed before the papacy of Pope John Paul II, the years of his papacy (1978-2005) were closely aligned with the years during which many national governments and secular international entities concerned themselves with ecological matters to a far greater extent than ever before. This greater attention—coupled with more urgent appreciation for and evidence of ecological harms—prompted the unprecedented intervention of the Holy See in environmental matters during the papacy of Pope John Paul II.

Now, his successor, Pope Benedict XVI, faces a world in which ecological concerns persist, and pressures for solutions continue to come from various constituencies. In particular, the recent public attention paid to fears about global climate change continue to raise the profile of ecological matters.³ Thus far, however, little attention has been paid to how Pope Benedict XVI may approach these issues or how his thought on ecological questions has developed through his writings during his many years as a leading theologian.

This paper will explore the writings of Pope Benedict XVI to ascertain the way in which he might approach the environmental questions of the modern world. Although, to date, he has reflected upon such issues primarily as a theologian and not as a pragmatic policy maker, the theological writings of Pope Benedict XVI provide insight into the approach he may take as international ecological issues confront his papacy.

When it comes to environmental issues, Pope Benedict XVI will not write on a blank slate. His theological and scholarly writings to date reflect an intricate, thoughtful reflection on the created world and the responsibility of humanity to that world. Indeed, in the internationally televised homily at the very inauguration of his papacy, when he was

353 (2000); Daniel M. Cowdin, *John Paul II and Environmental Concern: Problems and Possibilities*, 28 *LIVING LIGHT* 44 (1991-92); and Jeff Severns Guntzel, *John Paul II's Ecological Legacy*, *NATIONAL CATHOLIC REPORTER*, June 17, 2005 at 9A. For an excellent compilation of essays discussing Catholic social thought and ecology from various perspectives, see generally DREW CHRISTIANSEN, S.J. & WALTER GRAZER, EDS. "AND GOD SAW THAT IT WAS GOOD": CATHOLIC THEOLOGY AND THE ENVIRONMENT (1996).

³ As this paper was going to press in late March 2007, the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace was planning to convene an international Study Summit on Global Climate Change and Development, to be held at the Vatican on April 26-27, 2007. See CNS News Brief, *Pontifical Council Plans Spring Seminar on Climate Change*, January 30, 2007 (<http://catholicnews.com/data/briefs/cns/20070130.htm>).

invested with the pallium, he bluntly lamented to a worldwide audience that “the earth’s treasures no longer serve to build God’s garden for all to live in, but they have been made to serve the powers of exploitation and destruction.”⁴ This statement surprised some commentators,⁵ but it placed ecological concerns “on the map,” so to speak, in Pope Benedict XVI’s young papacy.

This paper will begin by providing some historical context for Pope Benedict XVI’s work in this area. It will then discuss four principal themes expressed repeatedly in his past writings that are likely to provide the basic framework for his approach to the ecological difficulties that exist at the dawn of the twenty-first century. It will then conclude with some predictions as to the ecological issues Pope Benedict will face in the years ahead, with attention to some of his early papal statements on ecological matters.

II. Context

In a recent reflection on Pope John Paul II’s environmental legacy, a commentator noted, “[h]ow future popes will respond to the crisis Pope John Paul II attempted to illuminate throughout his reign is unclear. But, no doubt, he left a road map.”⁶ Where Pope Benedict XVI will travel on that map remains to be seen. However, he comes to the papacy with a far more fully developed environmental legacy than that inherited by most of his predecessors.⁷ Although this paper will focus primarily on the thought of Pope Benedict XVI, a brief understanding of the current context—with “snapshots” of a few highlights from Pope John Paul II’s papacy—can be useful.

Under Pope John Paul II, the Vatican became a far more active participant in international discussions of ecological issues and human development problems. He “persistently tied a stewardship message to

⁴ Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI at Mass for the Imposition of the Pallium and Conferral of the Fisherman’s Ring for the Beginning of the Petrine Ministry of the Bishop of Rome*, Rome (April 24, 2005) [hereinafter “Inaugural Homily”].

⁵ This declaration immediately attracted the attention of observers. See, e.g., David Quinn & Richard Owen in Rome, *The Human Race Is the Sheep Lost in the Desert . . .*, IRISH INDEPENDENT, April 25, 2005 (discussing Pope Benedict XVI’s Inaugural Homily, and noting “the new Pope prov[ed] surprisingly outspoken—critical of the destruction of the environment.”); and *Id.* (“He decried the environmental destruction of much of the earth and the exploitation of the world’s resources.”).

⁶ Guntzel, *supra* note 2, at 10A.

⁷ *But see Id.* (arguing that, in contrast to his more publicized teachings, “John Paul II’s less-known legacy of strongly-worded statements denouncing the destructive relationship of humans to their habitat and promoting the spiritual necessity of environmental stewardship were little noticed . . . in his lifetime.”).

his more widely covered concerns over the excessive behavior of industrial nations, the adventures of science, and the plight of the world's poor."⁸ Although a number of his encyclicals, and an even greater number of his public addresses and comments made reference to the environment, four very specific events during the papacy of Pope John Paul II bear mentioning, as they provide an important context for the ecological position in which Pope Benedict XVI's papacy begins.

First, in his 1988 encyclical *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* ("On Social Concern")⁹ Pope John Paul II became the first Pope to provide a substantial discussion of ecological concerns in an encyclical. He articulated a number of themes that he would reiterate throughout his papacy, including the connection between ecology and human development, the link between environmental protection and personal morality, and the dangers of over-consumption in a world of limited resources.¹⁰ *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* proposed a comprehensive moral framework through which ecological issues should be viewed. More importantly, it proposed this framework in the formal context of an encyclical, thus affording it greater weight and broad attention.

Second, Pope John Paul II's 1990 World Day of Peace statement, *Peace With All of Creation*,¹¹ marked the first time that a pope issued a formal document devoted solely to ecological matters.¹² Although not an encyclical, this widely publicized document presented a comprehensive view of Pope John Paul II's ecological vision and, in doing so, greatly increased the profile of the Holy See in environmental affairs. It articulated such traditional themes such as the moral component of ecological problems, the importance of respecting the dignity of the human person in ecological discussions, the identification of the right to a safe environment as a basic human right, the link between ecology, poverty, and human development, and the environmental impact of nuclear and conventional warfare.¹³ This urgent call to international action highlighted the traditional aspects of Catholic social teaching

⁸ Guntzel, *supra* note 2, at 9A.

⁹ Pope John Paul II, *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* (December 30, 1987), in CATHOLIC SOCIAL THOUGHT: THE DOCUMENTARY HERITAGE 395 (DAVID J. O'BRIEN & THOMAS A. SHANNON EDS., 1992) [hereinafter "CATHOLIC SOCIAL THOUGHT"].

¹⁰ For further discussion, see generally Silecchia, *supra* note 2, at 693-697.

¹¹ Pope John Paul II, *Message for the Celebration of the World Day of Peace* (January 1, 1990), available at www.churchdocs.org/papal/jp.ii/ecology.crisis.

¹² See Guntzel, *supra* note 2, at 9A (reporting that this statement "marked what would be the beginning of a redoubling in his commitment to what he would come to call an 'ecological conversion'").

¹³ See Silecchia, *supra* note 2, at 697-704.

more directly and to much more public notice than prior documents. Many of these themes were rearticulated in the landmark 1994 edition of the *Catechism of the Catholic Church*,¹⁴ written with the close collaboration of then-Cardinal Ratzinger. The *Catechism* devoted a significant amount of attention to environmental matters—largely a first for catechetical documents.¹⁵

However, it was not only through papal teaching documents where Pope John Paul II asserted the Church's ecological vision. In two international events—one diplomatic and one ecumenical—he brought Catholic social teaching to bear on ecological concerns. The first of these events was the high profile and outspoken participation of the Holy See in the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development in June, 1992.¹⁶ Better known as the “Rio Conference,” at this gathering,

experts and diplomats gathered to set goals and policies that would, in theory, guide the world community in its response to environmental matters. On the one hand, it could be said that the Holy See developed no new doctrine in connection with the Rio Conference. However, the Rio Conference afforded the Holy See the opportunity to bring its developing environmental teachings to the word stage.¹⁷

In particular, the Holy See stressed that “[t]he basic principles that should guide . . . considerations of environmental issues are the integrity of all creation and respect for life and the dignity of the human person”¹⁸ and that “inhabitants of wealthier, developed nations ha[ve] a moral obligation to meet their environmental stewardship responsibilities in a way that would create long-term environmental benefit to the poorer corners of the globe.”¹⁹ These themes, strongly reiterated in the 2002 United Nations World Summit for Sustainable Development marking the tenth anniversary of the Rio Conference, placed the Holy See at odds with many other participants at the Rio Conference.²⁰ With

¹⁴ UNITED STATES CATHOLIC CONFERENCE, *CATECHISM OF THE CATHOLIC CHURCH* (English ed. 1994). The *CATECHISM* begins its discussion of ecological responsibility by noting:

[use] of the mineral, vegetable and animal resources of the universe cannot be divorced from respect for moral imperatives. Man's dominion over inanimate and other living beings granted by the creator is not absolute; it is limited by concern for the quality of life of his neighbor, including generations to come; it requires a religious respect for the integrity of creation. *Id.* at 580, ¶2415.

¹⁵ See Silecchia, *supra* note 2, at 721-723.

¹⁶ *Id.* at 713-20.

¹⁷ *Id.* at 713-14.

¹⁸ *Memorandum on the Holy See's Position*, in *SERVING THE HUMAN FAMILY: THE HOLY SEE AT THE MAJOR UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCES 111* (CARL J. MARUCCI, ED., 1997).

¹⁹ Silecchia, *supra* note 2, at 717-18.

²⁰ See discussion of the Holy See's intervention at the Rio Conference in Silecchia, *supra* note 2, at 713-723.

that, the Holy See established a significant role for itself in discussions on ecological matters.

Finally, in 2002, Pope John Paul II signed the *Common Declaration On Environmental Ethics* (popularly known as the “*Venice Declaration*”) with the Ecumenical Patriarch of the Greek Orthodox Church, Bartholomew I.²¹ In this document, “the two leaders expressed their joint beliefs in the goodness of creation, the centrality of the human person, and the belief that, at its core, the environmental crisis reflects moral failing.”²² By suggesting goals to be pursued, the Venice Declaration “was an important step, both in ecumenical environmental dialog and in articulat[ing] a core set of principles that could serve as a basis for international dialog and, perhaps, even consensus.”²³

Thus, the papacy of Pope John Paul II is noteworthy for the way in which it both *articulated* Catholic social thought on ecological questions far more than any prior papacy, and for the way in which it then *acted* on these teachings through the participation of the Holy See in diplomatic and ecumenical dialog on the international stage. It is in this context that Pope Benedict XVI began his papacy and in this context that his participation in ecological debate will take place. This is a climate in which it is expected first, that the Pope will continue to teach on and develop social teaching in environmental matters and, second, that the Holy See, under his leadership, will continue to intervene in relevant international discussions.

III. The Ecological Thought and Themes of Pope Benedict XVI

Upon first examination, it can be difficult to find lengthy, explicit writings of Pope Benedict XVI on ecological concerns. He has, of course, spent most of his public life and ministry as a theologian rather than a philosopher or politician. Thus, his writings have a decidedly different and more abstract tone from those of his predecessor, who wrote for a different audience and from a different perspective. However, a deeper examination of Pope Benedict XVI’s past writings as Cardinal Ratzinger and his growing collection of public statements since his 2005 election to the papacy reveal his developing thought on ecological matters.

²¹ *Common Declaration of Pope John Paul II and Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew I* (June 10, 2002), in KEENAN, *supra* note 2, at 149.

²² Silecchia, *supra* note 2, at 720.

²³ *Id.* at 721. See also Guntzel, *supra* note 2, at 10A (calling the Venice Declaration “a historic effort to cement the Christian obligation to environmental ethics” and noting that this document “went further than previous papal statements and issued a list of ‘ethical goals’”).

Indeed, two decades ago when many ecological issues were garnering attention for the first time, and several years before the first papal document dedicated solely to environmental issues, then-Cardinal Ratzinger had already published a series of his homilies in a book called *"In the Beginning . . .": A Catholic Understanding of the Story of Creation and the Fall*.²⁴ Although the primary focus of this book was a theological explication of the Genesis creation accounts, it also explored the relationship between humanity, creation, and Creator, as well as the implications that those complex relationships have for environmental responsibility. In many of his other writings as well, spanning decades, Pope Benedict XVI has explored these issues in greater detail. In reviewing those writings and his papal statements to date, four significant and consistent themes appear. Exploration of these themes reveals the basic contours of Pope Benedict XVI's ecological vision, and lays the groundwork for the way in which the Church will intervene in environmental matters throughout his papacy.

A. Creation Is a Vital Expression of the Creator

It is impossible to understand the ecological thought of Pope Benedict XVI without exploring the bedrock principle of his theological writing on this topic. Throughout his writings, he makes clear that physical creation is the concrete way in which the splendor,²⁵ power,²⁶ and loving goodness²⁷ of the Creator is manifested in this world.²⁸ As he wrote,

²⁴ IN THE BEGINNING *supra* note 1.

²⁵ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 3 (noting that the creation accounts in the book of Genesis generate "a feeling for the immeasurability of creation and its Creator."); Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, Les Combes, July 24, 2005 (speaking of the Transfiguration, and describing Mount Tabor as a place with "beauty in which the splendor of the Lord's divinity shone out."); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, October 26, 2005 (noting that Christ "receives honor from all of creation."); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Letter of His Holiness Benedict XVI to His Holiness Bartholomew I, Ecumenical Patriarch on the Occasion of the Sixth Symposium on "Religion, Science, and the Environment," Focusing on the Amazon River*, July 6, 2006 [hereinafter "Amazon River Letter"] ("[I]n their majestic beauty, . . . rivers and forests speak to us of God and of his grandiose work for humanity.").

²⁶ JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, THE FEAST OF FAITH: APPROACHES TO A THEOLOGY OF THE LITURGY (GRAHAM HARRISON, TRANS.) (1986) (hereinafter "FEAST OF FAITH") (observing that the "theme of glorification" can be "found in the Old Testament in the context of the theology of creation."); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 11 ("[T]his God of Israel was not a God like other gods, but . . . he was the God who held sway over every land and people. He could do this . . . because he himself had created everything in heaven and on earth."); *Id.* at 10 ("Israel always believed in the creator God, and this faith it shared with all the great civilizations of the ancient world. For, even in the moments when monotheism was eclipsed, all the great civilizations always knew of the Creator of heaven and earth."); Pope Benedict XVI, *Apostolic Exhortation Sacramentum Caritatis*,

February 22, 2007, ¶35 [*hereinafter* “*Sacramentum Caritatis*”] (“God allows himself to be glimpsed first in creation, in the beauty and harmony of the cosmos. In the Old Testament we see many sights of the grandeur of God’s power as he manifests his glory in his wondrous deeds.”) and Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, December 14, 2005 (“The purpose of the forceful images and expressions is to celebrate the Creator: ‘If the greatness of the works created is immense,’ said Theodore of Cyr, a Christian writer of the fifth century, ‘how much greater their Creator must be!’”).

²⁷ See JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE* 80-81 (GRAHAM HARRISON, TRANS.) (1986) (*hereinafter* “*SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE*”) (“Pentecost should also be for us a festival of thanksgiving for Creation, a cause for reflection on the creative Reason which is also manifested in the beauty of the world as a creative Love.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *GOD IS NEAR US* 52 (2003) (*hereinafter* “*GOD IS NEAR US*”) (“[A]ll our meals are alive with the goodness of God the Creator, and all thereby point toward this greatest feast of all, in which we receive no longer just earthly things, but the incarnate act of God’s mercy.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *GOSPEL, CATECHESIS, CATECHISM: SIDELIGHTS ON THE CATECHISM OF THE CATHOLIC CHURCH* 44 (1997) [*hereinafter* “*GOSPEL, CATECHESIS CATECHISM*”] (“Because God is the Creator, he loves all creatures.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Christmas Address to the Curia offering them His Christmas Greetings*, December 22, 2005 (*hereinafter* “*Christmas Address to the Curia*”) (“[T]here [is] the invitation not to see the world . . . solely as raw material . . . but to try to discover in it ‘the Creator’s handwriting,’ the creative reason and the love from which the universe was born and of which the universe speaks to us if we pay attention . . .”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, February 1, 2006 (calling God “a tender and loving King, concerned for all his creatures”); *Id.* (“The loftiest biblical prayer is in fact the celebration of the works of salvation, which reveal the Lord’s love for his creatures.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, March 7, 2007 (“[T]he entire cosmos reflects God’s providential love and mercy.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, February 8, 2006 (describing God as “a loving King who is attentive to his creatures”); *Id.* (declaring that “[i]n them [*i.e.*, all creatures] are exalted the divine compassion, tenderness, fidelity and goodness which are extended to the whole humanity, involving every creature. . . . God expresses his sovereignty by bending down to meet the frailest and most helpless of his creatures.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Message of the Holy Father Benedict XVI to the Youth of the World on the Occasion of the 22nd World Youth Day 2007* (January 27, 2007) (“[T]he signs of divine love are clearly present in creation.”).

²⁸ JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP OF FAITH: THE CHURCH AS COMMUNION* 290 (HENRY TAYLOR, TRANS.) (2005) (*hereinafter* “*PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP*”) (“Christian faith appeals to reason, to the transparency of creation in revealing the Creator.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *TRUTH AND TOLERANCE: CHRISTIAN BELIEF AND WORLD RELIGIONS* 172 (HENRY TAYLOR, TRANS.) (2004) (*hereinafter* “*TRUTH AND TOLERANCE*”) (“Only the true God, whom we may perceive in nature by thinking things out, is worshiped. But he is more than nature. He comes before it and it is his creation.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *TO LOOK ON CHRIST: EXERCISES IN FAITH, HOPE, AND LOVE* 27 (ROBERT NOWELL, TRANS.) (1991) (*hereinafter* “*TO LOOK ON CHRIST*”) (“We can ‘see’ God if we hearken to the voice of our essential nature, to the voice of creation, and let ourselves be led by this.”); *SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE*, *supra* note 27, at 117 (“God does not come to light in the artificial world of man-made things. So it is all the more necessary for us to leave our workaday world behind and go in search of the breath of creation in order that we may meet him and thus find ourselves.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY* 181 (JOHAN SAWARD, TRANS.) (2000) (*hereinafter* “*SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY*”) (“When we open our eyes, we can read the message of Christ in the language of the universe, and conversely, Christ grants us understanding of the message of creation.”); *IN THE*

“the same God who speaks to the whole world in the divine word and its radiance is the God who witnesses to himself in the sun, moon, and stars in the beauty and fullness of creation.”²⁹

It is highly likely that all ecological teachings of Pope Benedict XVI will emerge directly from his creation theology. As both a gift from³⁰ and an expression of the Creator, the natural world is deserving of, and demands the respect of, humanity. Indeed, in his very first encyclical letter, *Deus Caritas Est*, Pope Benedict XVI wrote, “[T]he universe in which we live has its source in God and was created by him. . . . [T]he whole world comes into existence by the power of his creative word. Consequently, his creation is dear to him, for it was willed by him and ‘made’ by him.”³¹ As “a sphere for the exercise of God’s will,”³² creation is viewed by Pope Benedict XVI as important if for no other reason than that it is the locus chosen by the Creator in which salvation and redemption will occur.³³

BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 3 (stating that the creation account in the Book of Genesis “stirs the heart from afar with its beauty and dignity and gives it an inkling of the mystery of eternity.”); *Id.* at 24 (“God himself shines through the reasonableness of his creation.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, May 18, 2005 (“[W]ith impassioned insistence, the ‘name of the Lord’ resounds at the centre of the prayer of adoration. All being and all time . . . are involved in a single action of grace. It is as if a ceaseless breath were rising from earth to heaven to praise the Lord, Creator of the universal and King of history.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, February 5, 2006 (“[T]his capacity to recognize the voice and manifestation of God in the beauty of creation belongs to all believers regardless of their religion.”).

²⁹ GOSPEL, CATECHESIS, CATECHISM, *supra* note 27, at 86.

³⁰ JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, GOD AND THE WORLD: BELIEVING AND LIVING IN OUR TIME 100 (HENRY TAYLOR, TRANS.) (2002) (*hereinafter* “GOD AND THE WORLD”) (“[C]reation is an act of total freedom, and that too is something the Christian tradition . . . has always emphasized, that God did not have to undertake creation, but did so quite freely.”).

³¹ Pope Benedict XVI, *Deus Caritas Est*, ¶ 9, December 25, 2005 (*hereinafter* “*Deus Caritas Est*”), available at www.vatican.va.

³² PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP, *supra* note 28, at 134.

³³ See IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 28 (“The creation accounts of all civilizations point to the fact that the universe exists for worship and for the glorification of God.”); *Id.* at 9 (“[T]he theme of creation is not set down once for all in one place; . . . it accompanies Israel throughout its history.”); *Id.* at 30 (“God created the universe in order to become a human being and pour out his love upon us and to invite us to love him in return.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, A NEW SONG FOR THE LORD 66 (TRANS.: MARTHA MATESICK) (1996) (*hereinafter* “A NEW SONG”) (“The resurrection connects the beginning and the end, creation and restoration.”); *Id.* at 69 (“[T]he world is not a neutral receptacle where human beings then accidentally became involved, but . . . right from the start creation came to be so that there would be a place for the covenant.”); THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 27 (“Creation looks toward the covenant, but the covenant completes creation and does not simply exist along with it.”); *Id.* at 108

This theological centrality of the created world leads to a deep conviction that it is to be respected and cherished simply out of love for God. Pope Benedict XVI has written that “[i]f creation is meant to be a space for the covenant, the place where God and man meet one another, then it must be thought of as a space for worship.”³⁴ Clearly, that which is a “space for worship” warrants respect and reverence. Conversely, failure to show proper respect for that which God has created is disrespectful and carelessly irreverent to the Creator himself.

In addition, Pope Benedict XVI has spoken eloquently of the unique ability of nature to draw humanity closer to God:

In contact with nature, individuals rediscover their proper dimension, they recognize that they are creatures but at the same time unique, “capable of God” since they are invariably open to the infinite. Driven by the heartfelt need for meaning that urges them onwards, they perceive the mark of goodness and divine Provi-

“The cosmos finds its true meaning in the Firstborn of creation. . . . From him comes the assurance that the adventure of creation . . . does not end up in absurdity and tragedy but, throughout all its calamities and upheavals, remains something positive.”); *Id.* at 24 (“[F]aith in redemption cannot be separated from faith in the Creator.”); TO LOOK ON CHRIST, *supra* note 28, at 65 (“All our hopes find their culmination in the one hope: thy kingdom come, thy will be done on earth as it is in heaven. The earth will become like heaven, it will itself become heaven.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, September 7, 2005 (“Christ is . . . the ‘firstborn’ of ‘all creation.’ Christ is before all things because he has been begotten since eternity, for ‘all things were created through him and for him.’ The ancient Jewish tradition also says that ‘the whole world was created in view of the Messiah.’”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, May 11, 2005 (“[C]hrist leads history wisely towards the dawn of the new heaven and the new earth.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, December 14, 2005 (“God knows everything and is present beside his creature who cannot elude him.”); *Id.* (“Every sphere of space, even the most secret, contains God’s active presence.”); GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 113 (“With the creation of the earth, so to speak, a workshop was provided for the Torah.”); *Id.* (“The world is created in order to provide a setting for the covenant by which God binds himself to man.”); *Id.* at 114 (“The world is, so to speak, the physical embodiment of the idea of the original thought God carried within him and which, through this embodiment has been made into a historical setting for the relationship between God and his creation.”); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 85 (“Only when creation and covenant come together can either creation or covenant be realistically discussed. The one presupposes the other.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, Rome, December 24, 2006 (“Jesus . . . makes us feel at home on this earth, sanctified by his presence. He asks us . . . to make it a home in which all are welcome.”)

See also SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 82:

Some time ago it might have seemed highly anthropomorphic, not to say anthropocentric when Paul says that creation waits with eager longing for the revelation of the sons of God. . . . But today we can sense the groaning of creation under the feet of those who no longer have anything to do with God and want to delete him from the world. Creation cries out to the sons of God, for it was created with a view to the Covenant.

³⁴ SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 26.

dence in the world that surrounds them, and open themselves almost spontaneously to praise and prayer. . . . [L]ove for nature . . . blossoms in gratitude to God.³⁵

Again, this insight is theological rather than practical. Nevertheless, this provides a direct spiritual rationale for creation care repeated frequently in the work of Pope Benedict XVI.

Pope Benedict XVI has often lamented what he perceives to be a lack of attention paid by modern theologians to the value of the created world. He observes that, “[p]aradoxically . . . the creation account is noticeably and nearly completely absent from catechesis, preaching, and even theology.”³⁶ He also expresses regret that “the theme of creation has been far removed from central to contemporary theological thinking. In fact, the theme of creation has played only a limited role in the theological discussion of recent years, indeed decades. It has seemed a question devoid of concrete anthropological importance.”³⁷ In the view of Pope Benedict XVI, a valid and accurate understanding of environmental obligations does not exist absent a fuller comprehension of this question.³⁸ The link between respect for God and respect for

³⁵ Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, Les Combes, July 17, 2005. See also JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINER & CHRISTOPHER SCHÖNBORN, INTRODUCTION TO THE CATECHISM OF THE CATHOLIC CHURCH 36 (1994) (“The catechism, together with Traditions, is aware that reason, dulled by sin, tends to close in upon itself. Yet, it does not forget that reason has not lost its native capacity to perceive the creator and his creation.”), and Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, December 20, 2006 (“Creation itself . . . leads us to discover and recognize the One who must come.”).

³⁶ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at ix. See also *Id.*, at x (decrying “the practical abandonment of the doctrine of creation in influential modern theology.”); *Id.* at xii (“With such an ‘existential’ reduction of the creation theme . . . there occurs a huge (if not total) loss of the reality of the faith whose God no longer has anything to do with matter.”); and *Id.* at 82 (“If we want to reappropriate faith in creation with its basic content and direction, then we must first bring it out of the obscurity . . . in . . . our current theological situation.”).

³⁷ *Id.* at 80.

³⁸ See, e.g., A NEW SONG, *supra* note 33, at 65:

[T]heologians often have a kind of phobia about treating the topic of creation. This, however, leads to the degeneration of faith into a kind of parochial ideology, to the worldlessness of faith and the godlessness of the world, which is life-threatening for both. Where creation shrinks to the world around us, human beings and the world are out of kilter. But, there is a complaint resounding ever more audibly out of this creation which has degenerated into mere environment, and precisely this complaint should tell us once more that the creature is in fact reaching out for the appearance of the children of God.

See also *Amazon River Letter*, *supra* note 25 (“The duty to emphasize an appropriate catechism concerning creation, in order to recall the meaning and religious significance of protecting it, is closely connected with our duty as Pastors and can have an important impact on the perception of the value of life itself as well as on the satisfactory solution of the consequent inevitable social problems.”).

his creation is, for Pope Benedict XVI, the source and foundation of ecological ethics. All else will build on this.

B. Liturgical Life and Natural Life Are Closely and Fundamentally Linked

Although many have written of the links between liturgical life and the rhythms and symbols of the natural world, few do so as eloquently as has Pope Benedict XVI who repeatedly writes that “[c]reation is designed in such a way that it is oriented to worship.”³⁹ As he wrote, “[w]e need to be reminded that liturgy involves the cosmos—that Christian worship is cosmic worship. In it we pray and sing in concert with everything ‘in heaven, on earth, and under the earth’; we join in with the praise rendered by the sun and the stars.”⁴⁰ In his writings, he explores the many ways in which religious life and Christian symbols evoke the created, natural world. In this way, he expresses deep respect for the ancient roots of Christian worship in the Old Testament, where religious ritual was inextricably intertwined with the rhythms of nature.⁴¹ These liturgical linkages do not lead directly to an obvious environmental policy, but they reflect two important elements of Pope Benedict XVI’s thought on ecological questions.

First, the mere act of tying creation and the natural world to religious life expresses a profound belief in the innate goodness and, indeed, holiness of that creation. The intimate connection between mundane natural events and the most intricate of theological mysteries leaves one with the unavoidable conclusion that there is a profound goodness in that nature.⁴² This connection can be seen in the liturgy,⁴³ the symbols of worship,⁴⁴ Scriptural references,⁴⁵ the parables of Christ,⁴⁶ sac-

³⁹ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 27.

⁴⁰ THE FEAST OF FAITH *supra* note 26, at 143.

⁴¹ See JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, MILESTONES: MEMOIRS 1927-1977, 17 (TRANS.: ERASMO LEIVO-MERIKAKIS) (1998) (*hereinafter* “MILESTONES”) (“The life of farmers was still organically structured in such a way that it enjoyed a firm symbiosis with the faith of the Church: birth and death, weddings and illnesses, sowing time and harvest time—everything was encompassed by the faith.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, August 17, 2005 (“[T]he horizon of the Psalm opens to the festive harvest, a symbol of joy born from the freedom, peace, and prosperity that are fruits of the divine blessing.”); and THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 105 (“In the spring the farmer sows seeds for autumn, in autumn for the coming year. Sowing seeds always points to the future. It belongs to the waning year, but also to the waxing year, for the waning year also points to a new future. In both seasons the mystery of hope is at work. . . .”).

⁴² Pope Benedict XVI, however, does not over-idealize nature or ignore its potential for harm. See GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 79 (“It is in fact one of the great riddles of creation that there seems to be a law of brutality.”); Pope Benedict XVI,

General Audience, Rome, August 24, 2005 (expressing sympathy to “the regions of Europe hit in the past few days by floods or fires, which have unfortunately claimed many victims and caused immense damage. Many families have been left homeless and hundreds of people must face tragic hardships.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, Castel Gandolfo, September 4, 2005 (“[W]e have all been distressed at the disaster caused by a hurricane in the United States of America, especially in New Orleans. I would like to assure you of my prayers. . . .”); JOSEPH RATZINGER, FAITH AND THE FUTURE 84 (KOSEL-VERLAG, TRANS.) (1971) (*hereinafter* “FAITH & THE FUTURE”) (“Anyone who grew up in the pre-technical age is unlikely to be tempted to fall for the romanticism of nature.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, June 22, 2005 (“God has saved his people from every evil whether they were threatened by enemies who rose against them, by raging waters about to engulf them, or by beasts of prey, the Lord was by their side.”).

⁴³ See, e.g., THE FEAST OF FAITH, *supra* note 26, at 135 (“Liturgy is not the private hobby of a particular group; it is about the bond which holds heaven and earth together; it is about the human race and the entire created world.”); THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 53 (“Christian worship is surely a cosmic liturgy which embraces both heaven and earth.”); *Id.* at 125 (“In the liturgy, the curtain between heaven and earth is torn open and we are taken up into a liturgy that spans the whole cosmos.”); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 28 (“Creation exists for the sake of worship.”); and *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶35 (“The beauty of the liturgy is part of this mystery; it is a sublime expression of God’s glory and, in a certain sense, a glimpse of heaven on earth.”).

⁴⁴ *Inaugural Homily*, *supra* note 4 (“The symbolism of the Pallium is . . . concrete: the lamb’s wool is meant to represent the lost, sick, or weak sheep which the shepherd places on his shoulders and carries to the water of life.”).

⁴⁵ Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, June 8, 2005 (“Today we feel a wind; the wind in Sacred Scripture is a symbol of the Holy Spirit.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, March 5, 2006 (“The image of the desert is a very eloquent message of the human condition.”); GOD IS NEAR US, *supra* note 27, at 25 (“[T]he well emerges as the image for life itself, right up to the well of Jacob, at which Jesus reveals himself as the wellspring of true life, the one for which the deepest thrust of mankind has been waiting. The well . . . becomes a sign for the mystery of Christ, who offers us the water of life and from whose opened side flow blood and water.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI for XXI World Youth Day*, Rome, April 9, 2006 (*hereinafter* “2006 World Youth Day Homily”) (“The Cross is the broken bow, in a certain way, God’s new, true rainbow which connects the heavens and the earth and bridges the abysses between the continents.”); POPE BENEDICT XVI, LET GOD’S LIGHT SHINE FORTH: THE SPIRITUAL VISION OF POPE BENEDICT XVI 160 (ROBERT MOYNIMAN, ED.) (2005) (*hereinafter* “SPIRITUAL VISION”) (“The cosmic symbol of the rising sun expresses the universality of God above all particular places.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of the Holy Father*, Rome, November 30, 2006 (“The Christian message, like the grain of wheat . . . fell on this land and bore much fruit.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Cappella Papale, December 8, 2005 (“God has impressed his own image, the image of the One who follows the lost sheep even up into the mountains and among the briars and thorn bushes of the sins of this world.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the Funeral Mass for Cardinal Giuseppe Caprio*, Rome, October 18, 2005 (calling Christ “the sun that never sets.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, December 31, 2006 (referring to Christ as “the new Sun rising on the horizon of humanity”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, April 26, 2006 (“Tradition is the living river that links us to the origins, the living river in which the origins are ever present, the great river that leads us to the gates of eternity.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, December 21, 2005 (“The Saviour awaited

ramental life,⁴⁷ the observance of the weekly Sabbath,⁴⁸ the liturgical calendar,⁴⁹ church art and architecture,⁵⁰ liturgical music,⁵¹ and the Eucharist itself.⁵²

by the people is hailed as the ‘Rising Star’; the star that points out the way to men and women and guides them as they journey through the shadows and dangers of the world toward the salvation promised by God and fulfilled in Jesus Christ.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Participants at the Meeting Promoted by the Pontifical Council ‘Cor Unum’*, Sala Clementina, January 23, 2006 (“Light and love are one and the same. They are the primordial creative powers that move the universe.”).

⁴⁶ *Inaugural Homily*, *supra* note 4 (“For the Fathers of the Church, the parable of the lost sheep, which the shepherd seeks in the desert, was an image of the mystery of Christ and the Church. The human race, everyone of us—is the sheep lost in the desert which no longer knows the way.”) and Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Holy Mass for the Ordination to the Priesthood of 15 Deacons of the Diocese of Rome*, Rome, May 7, 2006 (exploring more fully the parable of the sheep).

⁴⁷ See, e.g., JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY: BUILDING STONES FOR A FUNDAMENTAL THEOLOGY* 29 (MARY FRANCIS MCCARTHY, S.N.D., TRANS.) (1987) (*hereinafter* “PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY”) (“In the sacrament, . . . matter and word belong together, and precisely this is the source of its uniqueness. If the material sign expresses the unity of creation, the assumption of the cosmos into religion, the word, for its part, signifies the assumption of the cosmos into history.”); THE FEAST OF FAITH, *supra* note 26, at 71 (“The theology of creation and the theology of the resurrection . . . demand that prayer should be expressed in a bodily form, involving all the dimensions of bodily expression.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, January 7, 2007 (saying of Baptism, “Baptism is not only a word, it is not only something spiritual but also implies matter. All the realities of the earth are involved. . . . Water is the element of fertility. Without water there is no life. Thus, in all the great religions water is seen as the symbol of motherhood, of fruitfulness.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Sistine Chapel, January 8, 2006 (“Water is the symbol of life.”).

⁴⁸ See, e.g., THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 25 (“Creation moves toward the Sabbath, to the day on which man and the whole created order participates in God’s rest, in his freedom.”); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 27 (“Creation is oriented to the Sabbath, which is the sign of the covenant between God and humankind.”); A NEW SONG FOR THE LORD, *supra* note 33, at 65 (“[T]he connection between Sunday and creational faith becomes evident here . . . The Old and New Testaments cannot be separated, especially not in the interpretation of Sunday. Creation and faith cannot be detached from each other, least of all at the core of the Christian profession.”); *Id.* at 69 (“[I]t is fundamental that the Sabbath is part of the story of creation. One could actually say that the metaphor of the seven-day week was selected for the creation account because of the Sabbath. By culminating in the sign of the covenant, the Sabbath, the creation account clearly shows that creation and covenant belong together from the start.”); and JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *SEEKING GOD’S FACE* 13 (TRANS.: DAVID SMITH AND ROBERT CUNNINGHAM) (1982) (*hereinafter* “SEEKING GOD’S FACE”) (“The eighth day is also the day of His resurrection and at the same time the day of creation. God’s creation does not come to nothing. It is always moving toward the resurrection. . . . In the midst of passing time, there is always a new beginning.”).

⁴⁹ CARDINAL JOSEPH RATZINGER, *JOURNEY TOWARDS EASTER* 55-56 (TRANS. MARY GROVES O.S.B.) (1987) (*hereinafter* “JOURNEY TOWARDS EASTER”) (“[W]e receive the year from the

hand of God, receive our time from the Creator and Redeemer, and confide sowing and harvesting to his goodness, thanking him for the fruit of the earth, and our work. . . . [T]hrough our prayer, creation enters into the Eucharist, has part in the praise of God.”); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 31 (“[E]very seventh year is also a Sabbath, during which earth and human beings rest . . . The earth is to be received back from the creating hands of God, and everyone is to begin anew.”); THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 109 (“The birthday of St. John the Baptist takes place on the date when the days begin to shorten, just as the birthday of Christ takes place when they begin again to lengthen. . . . The close interweaving of incarnation and resurrection can be seen precisely in the relation, both proper and common, that each has the rhythm of the sun and its symbolism.”); GOD IS NEAR US, *supra* note 27, at 61 (“[T]he Resurrection took place on the first day of the week. The Jews saw this as the day on which the world was created. For Jesus’ disciples, it became the day on which a new world began, the day when with the breaking of the bonds of death, the new creation had its beginning.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, December 21, 2005 (“[T]he Feast of Christmas coincides with the days of the winter solstice, after which the daylight time gradually lengthens, in accordance with the sequence of the seasons. This helps us understand better the theme of light that overcomes the darkness.”); *Christmas Address to the Curia*, *supra* note 27 (“Christmas is a feast of light and peace.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, March 1, 2006 (saying, of Lent, “[I]n this liturgical season, the People of God from the earliest times have drawn abundant nourishment from the Word of God to strengthen their faith, reviewing the entire history of creation and redemption.”).

⁵⁰ THE FEAST OF FAITH, *supra* note 26, at 143:

[I]n church architecture, . . . we should see to it that churches are not designed merely with human utility in mind, but that they stand in the cosmos, inviting the sun to be a sign of the praise of God and a sign of the mystery of Christ for the assembled community. A rediscovery of the value of the Church building’s eastward orientation would help, it seems to me, in rediscovering a spirituality which embraces the dimension of creation.”

See also THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 132 (“Sacred art finds its subjects in the images of salvation.”); and *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶41 (“The profound connection between beauty and the liturgy should make us attentive to every work of art placed at the service of the celebration.”).

⁵¹ See, e.g., THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 152; *Id.* (“All our singing is a singing and praying with the great liturgy that spans the whole of creation.”); and *Id.* at 221-23 (describing in detail the natural elements present in Christian liturgy). See also Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Concert to Commemorate the Election of the Holy Father*, April 21, 2006 (“[M]usic also helps us grasp the most intimate nuances of human genius, in which is reflected something of the incomparable beauty of the Creator of the universe.”).

⁵² THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 173:

The elements of the earth are transubstantiated, pulled, so to speak, from their creaturely anchorage, grasped at the deepest ground of their being, and changed into the Body and Blood of the Lord. The New Heaven and the New Earth are anticipated.

See also *id.* at 173 (“God himself acts and does what is essential. He inaugurates the new creation, makes himself accessible to us, so that through the things of the earth, through our gifts, we can communicate with him in a personal way.”); THE FEAST OF FAITH, *supra* note 26, at 135 (observing that Christ “willed to give himself in the grain of the wheat and the fruit of the vine.”); *Id.* at 136 (“[T]he Christian feasts are also

Indeed, Pope Benedict XVI began the October 2005 Synod of Bishops with a homily replete with references to the profound link between the Eucharist and nature:

In Sacred Scripture, bread represents all that human beings need for their daily life. Water makes the earth fertile: it is the fundamental gift that makes life possible. Wine, on the other hand, expresses the excellence of creation and gives us the feast in which we go beyond the limits of our daily routine. . . . So it is that wine and with it the vine have also become images of the gift of love.⁵³

With his extensive theological reflections on these linkages—reflections that span decades—Pope Benedict XVI has built a very well-crafted body of thought that links the natural world to religious worship. If religious worship is oriented toward the good, and natural cre-

involved with the rhythm of the year, the rhythm of seedtime and harvest. How could it be otherwise in a liturgy which has at its center the sign of bread, fruit of the earth and heaven? Here, this fruit of the earth, bread, is privileged to be the bearer of him in whom heaven and earth . . . have become one.”); *Id.* at 134 (“The world is thus declared to be the realm of God’s creative word; matter is subordinated to the power of his Spirit. For matter too is his creation and hence the sphere of his gracious power. Ultimately, we receive the very bread of the earth from his hands.”); *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶47 (“[I]n the bread and wine that we bring to the altar, all creation is taken up by Christ the Redeemer to be transformed and presented to the Father.”); *Id.* at ¶92 (“The Christian people, in giving thanks to God through the Eucharist, should be conscious that they do so in the name of all creation, aspiring to the sanctification of the world and working intensely to that end.”); and *Id.* (“[D]uring the presentation of the gifts, the priest raises to God a prayer of blessing and petition over the bread and wine, ‘fruit of the earth,’ ‘fruit of the vine’ and ‘work of human hands.’ With these words, the rite not only includes . . . all human efforts and activity, but also leads us to see the world as God’s creation, which brings forth everything we need for our sustenance.”).

⁵³ Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Opening of the 11th Ordinary Assembly of the Synod of Bishops*, Rome, October 2, 2006 [hereinafter “*Synod Opening Homily*.”]. See also *Id.* (“Christ himself became the vine, and this vine always bears good fruit.”). This link was explored more fully by other participants at the Synod. See John L. Allen, Jr., *Coverage of Bishops’ Synod on the Eucharist, Report #5: Environment, Social Justice Emerge as Eucharistic Themes*, NATIONAL CATHOLIC REPORTER, October 6, 2005 (www.nationalcatholicreporter.org/word/sb100605.htm) (“[Q]uietly a number of other surprising themes are emerging, including the connection between the Eucharist and ecology. Two bishops from the developing world have insisted that if the Eucharist is the summit of all creation, then it necessarily implies concern for the integrity of the environment.”). A full text of the conversation of this topic can be found at *Synodus Episcoporum Bulletin—XI Ordinary General Assembly of the Synod of Bishops: The Eucharist: Source and Summit of the Life and Mission of the Church*, 06-04.10.2005 (An unofficial English transcript from the Holy See Press Office is available on line at www.vatican.va/news_services/press/sinodo/documents/bollettino_21_xi-ordinario). This theme was reiterated when Pope Benedict XVI commented, “The relationship between the Eucharist and the cosmos helps us to see the unity of God’s plan and to grasp the profound relationship between creation and the ‘new creation’ inaugurated in the resurrection of Christ, the new Adam.” *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶92.

ation is visible in religious worship, then clearly there is a good in nature to which Pope Benedict XVI's work consistently refers. As he explains, "man's own being is insufficient for what he has to express, and so he invites the whole of creation to become a song with him."⁵⁴

Second, and more subtlety, it is the cyclical, repetitive characteristic of nature—and not the dramatic beauty of rare events—that gets the most attention from Pope Benedict XVI. This is especially apparent in his writings that link creation to the cyclical and repetitive nature of liturgical life. Although on occasion his writings venture briefly into the exultation of nature's dramatic splendor, his typical pattern is one of greater restraint, in which it is the more mundane order of creation that earns his awe. This suggests that it is nature's often underappreciated order, stability, and logic that is the truly valuable part of creation.⁵⁵ By definition, then, a disruption of that rhythm and logic through abuse of the environment would run contrary to the order and rhythm created by God and enshrined at the very heart of liturgical life. As he wrote, "[w]e live in a world created by God along rational lines, and he has entrusted this world to us so that we may rethink the

⁵⁴ THE SPIRIT OF THE LITURGY, *supra* note 28, at 136.

⁵⁵ See JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE? 38 (TRANS. BRIAN MCNEIL, C.R.V.) (1994) (*hereinafter* "A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE"):

[N]ature is not-as is asserted by a totalitarian scientism—some assemblage built up by chance and its rules of play, but is rather a creation. A creation in which the *Creator Spiritus* expresses himself. This is why there are not only natural laws in the sense of physical functions: the specific natural law is itself moral law. Creation itself teaches us how we can be human in the right way.

See also PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP OF FAITH, *supra* note 28, at 288 ("[T]he way the [text of the creation story] moves toward the Sabbath is trying to make clear that creation has an inner basis and purpose. It is there in order that the covenant may come to be in which God freely gives his love and receives the response of love."); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 17 ("The reasonableness of creation derives from God's Reason, and there is no other really convincing explanation."); *Id.* at 23-24 ("In what is most vast, in the world of heavenly bodies, we see revealed a powerful Reason that holds the universe together. And we are penetrating ever deeper into what is smallest, into the cell and into the primordial units of life; here, too, we discover a Reason that astounds us."); *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶92 ("The world is not something indifferent, raw material to be utilized simply as we see fit. Rather, it is part of God's good plan."); and SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 30:

Not everything is appropriate at all times: the human being needs a rhythm, and the year gives him this rhythm, both through creation and through the history which faith sets forth in the yearly cycle. This brings us to the Church's year, which enables man to go through the whole history of salvation in step with the rhythm of creation, simultaneously ordering and purifying the chaotic multiplicity of our nature. Nothing human is omitted from this cycle of creation and history.

thoughts of his reason with our reason, and learn to govern, order, and shape the world according to his thoughts.”⁵⁶

It may be more typical—and effective—for ecologists or environmentalists to garner support by drawing the attention of an often apathetic public to a dramatic or beautiful element of the natural world. However, Pope Benedict XVI’s writings speak of the routine, cyclical patterns of the natural order that warrant respect and protection.⁵⁷ He has written:

What we had previously celebrated—namely, that through faith in creation the world has been demythologized and made reasonable; that sun, moon, and stars are no longer strange and powerful divinities but merely lights; that animals and plants have lost their mystic qualities: all this has become an accusation against Christianity. Christianity is said to have transformed all the power of the universe, which were once our brothers and sisters, into utilitarian objects for human beings, and in so doing it has led them to misuse plants and animals and in fact all the world’s powers for the sake of an ideology of progress that thinks only of itself and cares only for itself. What can be said in reply to this? The Creator’s directive to humankind means that it is supposed to look after the world as God’s creation, and to do so *in accordance with the rhythm and the logic of creation*.⁵⁸

This line of thought is likely to garner greater attention as scientists and ecologists learn ever more about the large scale rhythms and cycles of the created world, and the long-term harms that can arise from the careless disruption of that order.⁵⁹

C. Technology Holds Both the Capacity to Aid and to Destroy the Earth’s Well-Being

A third theme woven throughout Pope Benedict XVI’s writings is a warning about the ability of technology to be misused, with harmful

⁵⁶ A NEW SONG, *supra* note 33, at 38. *See also* JOURNEY TOWARD EASTER, *supra* note 49, at 92 (“[T]he world has to be continually defended from chaos, creation must always be protected and made new.”).

⁵⁷ Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, December 31, 2006 (discussing “the solar cycle with its rhythms”).

⁵⁸ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 33-34 (emphasis added).

⁵⁹ *See* GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 73 (“[C]reation is indeed a mystery, and the more we know about it, the more physics is able to see into the delicate structure of matter, the more mysterious it appears.”); and IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 34:

[T]he world is to be used for what it is capable of and for what it is called to, but not for what goes against it. Biblical faith implies in the first place that human persons are not closed in upon themselves: they must always be aware that they are situated in the context of the body of history, which will ultimately become the body of Christ. Past, present, and future must encounter and penetrate one another in every human life. Our age is the first to experience that hideous narcissism that cuts itself off from both past and future and that is preoccupied exclusively with its own present.

environmental consequences. Pope Benedict XVI's writings express an ambivalent⁶⁰—or, even, pessimistic—outlook toward technology in the ecological context, as well as in other realms:

Progress has always been a word with a mythical ring. It continues to be portrayed insistently as the norm of political activity and of human behavior in general and as their highest moral qualification. Anyone who looks even at only the last hundred years cannot deny that immense progress has been made in medicine, in technology, and in the understanding and harnessing of the forces of nature, and one may hope for further progress. At the same time, however, the ambivalence of this progress is obvious. Progress is beginning to put Creation—the basis of our existence—at risk; it creates inequality among human beings, and it generates ever new threats to the world and humanity. This makes moral controls of progress indispensable.⁶¹

While he acknowledges that there are undeniable advantages to human technological progress,⁶² Pope Benedict XVI's writings indicate an urgent wariness about the misuse of technology and the harm this may pose to the environment in two distinct ways.⁶³ First, and most directly, this misuse has a physical component that can wreck havoc with the natural world. However, it also has a moral and attitudinal component that can be equally destructive for the long term welfare of the environment. As Pope Benedict XVI warns, “[w]e live in a time in which science and technology offer extraordinary possibilities for improving

⁶⁰ See, e.g., JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *CHRISTIANITY AND THE CRISIS OF CULTURES* 29 (TRANS.: BRIAN McNEIL) (2005) (*hereinafter* “CRISIS OF CULTURES”) (observing that “scientific rationality . . . has given us both enormous possibilities and enormous menaces.”).

⁶¹ JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, *VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL* 25 (2006) (*hereinafter* “VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL”).

⁶² See, e.g., JOSEPH RATZINGER, *THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS OF VATICAN II*, 159-60 (TRANS: HENRY TRAUB, S.J.) (1966) (*hereinafter* “THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS OF VATICAN II”):

The connection between the Christian and technology does not come through sacralization of technology, but only through the idea of love seen without illusions. Technological service becomes Christian when it is motivated by a service which seeks to humanize men—that is, when it serves love. Then, and only then, does technological progress serve Christianity and only then is it really progress. The Christian message cannot have as its purpose the glorification of the technological.

See also FAITH AND THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 86-87 (“[W]e must understand the striking optimism with which the Vatican Council viewed the technological age and judges its advances to be realizations of the primeval commission to man to subdue the whole earth.”); *Id.* at 84 (“Technology creates new opportunities for humanity.”).

⁶³ The urgency of this question is expressed in *A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE*, *supra* note 55, at 95, where then-Cardinal Ratzinger notes, “The resistance of creation to its manipulation by men has become a new factor in the intellectual situation in the last decade. It is impossible to evade the question of the limits of science and of the criteria it must follow.”

everyone's existence. But a distorted use of this power can seriously and irreparably threaten the destiny of life itself."⁶⁴

Pope Benedict XVI fears the obvious physical harm to the environment that is posed by misused technology. This is a concern shared by many secular ecologists as well. He warns against a world in which the distinctions between the good uses of technology and the destructive ones have been blurred. Reflecting on modern developments, he observes that "[t]he resistance of creation to its manipulation by men has become a new factor in the intellectual situation in the last decade. It is impossible to evade the question of the limits of science and of the criteria it must follow."⁶⁵ With much concern, he notes that the world is now at an unprecedented point in which humanity is capable of widespread ecological destruction,⁶⁶ and asks "how are we to know when technology is appropriate to the claims of creation and when it is becoming destructive?"⁶⁷ That destructive capability, brought on by technological advances, is a frightening one—and one the pope views as a

⁶⁴ Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Italian Christian Workers' Associations*, Clementine Hall, January 27, 2006.

⁶⁵ A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 95.

⁶⁶ See, e.g., TRUTH AND TOLERANCE, *supra* note 28, at 158:

[I]f we think of the way science had made use of producing ever more frightful means for the destruction of men and of the world, then it is obvious that there is such a thing as science that has taken a pathological form: science becomes pathological and a threat to life when it takes leave of the moral order of human life, becomes autonomous, and no longer recognizes any standard but its own capabilities.

See also JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, MANY RELIGIONS—ONE COVENANT: ISRAEL, THE CHURCH, AND THE WORLD 93-94 (TRANS. GRAHAM HARRISON) (1991) (*hereinafter* "MANY RELIGIONS") ("Now, therefore, at a time when mankind has acquired the ability to destroy itself and its planet, it is clear that religions share a common responsibility to overcome this temptation"); A NEW SONG, *supra* note 33, at 37 (describing "fear of the ecological threat to the roots of life caused by the unstoppable momentum of a technology that was created by humans as their power over nature, but now threatens to become a force turned against them, a power that has slipped out of their control and dominates them rather than being the means by which they dominate."); GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 119 ("A gnat can do what is in it to do, no more and no less. Man, however, with all humanity, holds in his hands the entire sum of hidden human potential. He can in the end develop methods of destruction that are beyond the capability of any other living thing."); FAITH AND THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 81 ("The hand of man reaches out to the heavens, nothing is impossible anymore."); *Deus Caritas Est*, *supra* note 31, at ¶ 30(a) ("Despite the great advances made in science and technology, each day we see how much suffering there is in the world on account of different types of poverty, both material and spiritual.").

⁶⁷ PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP OF FAITH, *supra* note 28, at 289.

critical danger. In a very real sense, technology can pose a threat to the 21st century environment in a way that it did not do before. In the past, environmental harm was essentially localized. While the potential for severe environmental harm existed, that harm would, most often, be confined to a local area. Now, however, human activity may have the ability to pose a threat that may reach a global scale. Pope Benedict XVI has written that

[e]cological disaster could serve as a warning to us, that we may see where science is no longer at the service of truth, but is destructive both of the world and of man. The ability to hear such warnings, the will to let oneself be purified by the truth, is essential.⁶⁸

These repeated warnings about technology speak to the need to use wisdom and prudence to ensure that misuse or overuse of technology does not harm the environment.

Equally dangerous as this physical threat, however, is the indirect attitudinal and moral danger that new technology poses to the environment. Pope Benedict XVI repeatedly expresses his consistent concern that the increase in technology and scientific development has created a sentiment among many that humanity is now entirely in control of creation.⁶⁹ He laments that

Previously human beings could only transform particular things in nature; nature as such was not the object but rather the presupposition of their activity. Now, however, it itself has been delivered over to them *in toto*. Yet, as a result, they suddenly see themselves imperiled as never before. The reason for this lies in the attitude that views creation only as the product of chance and necessity. Thus it has no law, no direction of its own. The inner rhythm that we infer from the

⁶⁸ TRUTH AND TOLERANCE, *supra* note 28, at 159.

⁶⁹ See, e.g., PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY, *supra* note 47, at 93 (“This liberation of man from the soul of the earth, from the foreordination to which he owes his existence, is most evident in the notion of perfect domination over life and death.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, CHURCH, ECUMENISM, AND POLITICS: NEW ESSAYS IN ECCLESIOLOGY 184 (1988) (*hereinafter* “CHURCH, ECUMENISM, AND POLITICS”) (noting that modern man enjoys “emancipation from the compulsion of nature.”); SPIRITUAL VISION, *supra* note 45, at 142 (“Biological manipulation is striving to uncouple man from nature.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Urbi et Orbi Message of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, December 25, 2006 (“Is a ‘Savior’ still needed by a humanity which has reached the moon and Mars and is prepared to conquer the universe; for a humanity which knows no limits in its pursuit of nature’s secrets and which has succeeded even in deciphering the marvelous codes of the human genome?”); Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, January 3, 2007 (condemning “scientific atheism”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Roman Curia Offering Them His Christmas Greetings*, December 22, 2006 (“[T]he power the human being holds in his hands which science has increased, is increasingly becoming a danger that threatens the human being himself and the world. Reason totally oriented to taking the world in hand, no longer accepts limits.”).

scriptural account—the rhythm of worship, which is the rhythm of the history of God’s love for humankind—is stilled. Today we can see without any difficulty the horrible consequences of this attitude.⁷⁰

This view excludes God from the world,⁷¹ and can lead to environmental destruction as well as other ills to the human family that result from such arrogance,⁷² when technology breeds a “culture in which scientific

⁷⁰ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 37.

⁷¹ See PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP OF FAITH, *supra* note 28, at 290 (“There is today a materialistic version of the theory of evolution that presents itself as being the last word in science and lays claim to have made the creative spirit superfluous through its hypothesis, indeed to have excluded it definitively.”); JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, THE RATZINGER REPORT: AN EXCLUSIVE INTERVIEW ON THE STATE OF THE CHURCH 66 (WITH VITTORIO MESSORI) (1985) (*hereinafter* “RATZINGER REPORT”) (“Faith, indeed, is threatened with destruction every time science sets itself up as an absolute.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Cappella Papale, December 8, 2005 (“If we live in opposition to love and against the truth—in opposition to God—then we destroy one another and destroy the world. Then we do not find life but an act in the interests of death.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Presentation of the Letters Accrediting New Ambassadors to the Holy See*, Rome, June 16, 2005 (*hereinafter* “Address to New Ambassadors”) (“[O]ur world is facing numerous challenges that it must successfully confront so that the human person may always triumph over technology.”); FAITH AND THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 5 (lamenting that “a great gulf is developing between the world of faith and the world of science.”); THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS OF VATICAN II, *supra* note 62, at 161-162 (“[T]echnological application of scientific insights has given man an entirely new kind of power over the world. This in turn implies a new orientation toward human existence, based on the opportunity to make things functional in the service of man. . . . He no longer approaches the world from the viewpoint of contemplation and wonder, but as one who manages, weighs, and acts.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Participants at the 20th International Conference Organized by the Pontifical Council for Health Pastoral Care on the Theme of the Human Genome*, Rome, November 19, 2005:

The contemporary world is marked by the process of secularization. Through complex cultural and social events, it has not only claimed a just autonomy for science and the organization of society but has all too often also obliterated the link between temporal realities and their creator, even to the point of neglecting to safeguard the transcendent dignity of human beings and respect for human life itself.

⁷² See THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS OF VATICAN II, *supra* note 62, at 158:

[W]e must also recognize that suspicion is not completely allayed until we have freely and without illusion examined the negative and retrogressive aspects of progress and have honestly measured the difference between technological and human progress. But, the crucial question goes even deeper . . . What is the relationship between technological progress and Christian hope?

See also Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to H.E. Mr. Ivan Guillermo Rincon Urdaneta, Ambassador of the Bolivian Republic of Venezuela to the Holy See*, Rome, August 25, 2005 [*hereinafter* “Venezuela Address”] “[T]he social situation does not improve with the application of technological means alone; it is also

and technical self-determination is becoming ever more total.”⁷³ In the view of Pope Benedict XVI, the humility that comes from understanding that the Creator rules creation is in danger from the growing perception that humanity is now in complete control. Thus, creation itself is imperiled. He has written:

We have learned all the things that can be done with nature. The significance of this knowledge and of the ability that has been attained in this way should not be belittled. The only thing is that, if we grant validity to this way of thinking alone, the throne of domination over nature on which we have placed ourselves will have been built on nothing: it must collapse and bring us and the world down in its fall. To be able to do and make is one thing, to be able to be is another: being able to do and make is of no use if we do not know what it is for, if we no longer ask who we are and what the truth of things is.⁷⁴

Rather than pursue this arrogant view, he advocates a more modest view of humble thanksgiving. “Thanksgiving for creation,” he says, “could then become a reflection on creation, a reflection on behavior appropriate to our being part of creation. This would be acting according to the Spirit turning away from the . . . materialism that abuses and betrays the world.”⁷⁵ In his very first Christmas greeting to the Roman Curia, Pope Benedict XVI offered an “invitation not to see the world that surrounds us solely as raw material with which we can do something, but to try to discover in it ‘the Creator’s handwriting,’ the creative reason and the love from which the world was born and of which the universe speaks to us, if we pay attention, if our inner senses awaken and acquire perception of the deepest dimensions of reality.”⁷⁶

necessary to pay special attention to promoting values, with respect for the ethical dimension proper to the person, the family and social life.”) and FAITH & THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 71 (“Positivism, exact scientific method, is unbelievably useful and absolutely necessary for mastery of the problems of ever-developing humanity. But positivism as a philosophy of life is intolerable and the end of humanity.”).

⁷³ PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY, *supra* note 47, at 15.

⁷⁴ TO LOOK ON CHRIST, *supra* note 28, at 22. See also *Synod Opening Homily*, *supra* note 53 (“We men and women, to whom creation is, as it were, entrusted for its management, has usurped it. We ourselves want to dominate it in the first person and by ourselves. We want unlimited possession of the world and of our own lives.”); THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS OF VATICAN II, *supra* note 62, at 164 (“Technology does not decide whether progress works to salvation or destruction; this decision comes from another source. Thus a perspective opens up which looks toward the only redemptive force—the saving power of love.”); and VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL *supra* note 61, at 26 (“[S]cience . . . is subject to moral criteria and . . . its true nature is lost wherever the only criterion to which it adheres is power or commerce—or even merely success—instead of human dignity.”).

⁷⁵ SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 81.

⁷⁶ *Christmas Address to the Curia*, *supra* note 27. He proposed this invitation as an alternative to “radical liberalism and the natural sciences, which . . . claimed to em-

This concern about the ecological impact of technology is a concern that Pope Benedict XVI has shared in his ecumenical dialogue. Pope Benedict XVI and Patriarch Bartholomew I issued a joint statement in which they both lamented the ways in which the arrogant use of technology can lead to environmental harm. They wrote:

[I]n the face of the grave threats to the natural environment, we want to express our concern at the negative consequences for humanity and for the whole of creation which can result from economic and technological progress that does not know its limits. . . . [W]e consider it one of our duties to encourage and to support all efforts made to protect God's creation, and to bequeath to future generations a world in which they will be able to live.⁷⁷

Thus, the third element of Pope Benedict XVI's ecological thought—and one about which he has already preached as Pope—is to exercise caution when contemplating the harms that advancing technology may pose to the physical environment and, in so doing, embrace a correct understanding of humanity's place *vis-à-vis* Creator and creation.

D. Humanity Must Be Respected in Proposed Ecological Solutions

The fourth theme of Pope Benedict XVI's ecological thinking is one that places him in very close alliance with his predecessor, and simultaneously may put him at odds with many secular environmentalists. Pope Benedict XVI acknowledges that humanity is capable of and, indeed, engages in, destructive behavior *vis a vis* the environment.⁷⁸ Indeed, he laments that “[t]he problems of our time are attributable

brace with their knowledge the whole of reality to its limit, stubbornly proposing to make the ‘hypothesis of God’ superfluous.” *Id.*

⁷⁷ Pope Benedict XVI and Patriarch Bartholomew I, *Common Declaration by His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI and Patriarch Bartholomew I*, November 30, 2006. These ecumenical collaborations are discussed more fully in John L. Allen, Jr., *Pope and Patriarch Both Speak Out on Environment*, NATIONAL CATHOLIC REPORTER, Jan. 12, 2007 at 14.

⁷⁸ See GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 51.

The Christian faith holds that the creation has been damaged. Human existence is no longer what was produced at the hands of the Creator. It is burdened with another element that produces, besides the innate tendency toward God, the opposite tendency away from God. In this way, man is torn between the original impulse of creation and his own historical inheritance.

See also IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 81 (“God’s creation and ‘nature’ are having to defend themselves against the limitless pretensions of human beings as creators. Human beings want to understand the discovered world only as material for their own creativity. Suddenly, humans’ own creations no longer appear simply as a hope, possibly humankind’s only one, but rather as a threat: humans are sawing off the branch on

in good measure to the fact that we have regarded the world as mere matter, and matter as mere raw material for the production line. We need not be surprised that a world that is nothing but matter is becoming uninhabitable.”⁷⁹ He does not underestimate the human capacity for wrongdoing and has decried “[t]he human threat to all living things, which is being spoken of everywhere these days.”⁸⁰ He soberly warns that “the ominous effects of our own activities—the very elements by which we live—are threatened with destruction by the poisonous breath of our techniques; the energies upon which we depend seem, by their by-products, to be turning into the forces of our eventual annihilation.”⁸¹

Simultaneously, however, he forcefully rejects the view that humanity is to be vilified and attacked as a prerequisite for environmental progress. He expresses regret that “[t]he image of man that dominates in modern literature, in visual arts, cinema, and theater is primarily a gloomy image.”⁸² He also criticized the fact that:

. . . [T]here is devised a new and no less ruinous view—an attitude that looks upon the human being as a disturber of the peace, as the one who wrecks everything, as the real parasite and disease of nature. Human beings no longer have any use for themselves; they would prefer to put themselves out of the way so that nature might be well again. But this is not how to bring healing to the world, for we go against the Creator when we no longer want to exist as the human beings that he wanted to exist. It is not thus that we heal nature, but rather thus that we destroy both ourselves and creation by removing from it the hope that lies in it and the greatness to which it is called.⁸³

The view of humanity that Pope Benedict XVI proposes may be seen by many as unrealistic in its praise of the potential for good that is possessed by mankind. He writes, in a discussion of the patron saint of ecology:

which they sit. The real creation seems like a refuge, to which they look back and which they seek anew.”).

⁷⁹ SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 80.

⁸⁰ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at ix.

⁸¹ FAITH AND THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 85.

⁸² A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 15. *See also* SEEKING GOD’S FACE, *supra* note 48, at 43 (“We are living in a time when man is denounced as a naked ape or as a particularly treacherous rat and when he is regarded as the real mischief maker who is destroying nature. Man is disgusted with mankind and fears his fellow men. His hatred of the humanity in himself and in others is clearly growing.”); and IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 93 (“Reaction and resentment against technology . . . has long since become a resentment against humans, who are seen as the disease of nature. This being that emerges out of nature’s exact objectivity and straightforwardness is responsible for disturbing the beautiful balance of nature.”).

⁸³ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 38.

[W]e are interested in Francis of Assisi especially as a lover of animals and as the patron saint of those who are concerned with the conservation of our natural environment. In our greed, we are stripping the world more and more of its natural resources, and our concern to protect nature is certainly both good and necessary.

Many of those most concerned in this work, however, are seriously mistaken in the emphasis they place on man in this question of conservation. They see man as the only real mischief-maker who is exclusively responsible for upsetting the peaceful balance of nature. Much of what they say points to a scornful attitude toward man and a desire to limit his spirit.

Francis' attitude toward man and nature was quite different. The seraphic idea of man, in whom the creature learns to soar and to sing, to transcend itself and give of itself, was fulfilled in him. Whenever that happens, the deepest longing of the creature is expressed and its hidden sadness is transmuted into confidence and joy. Nature will not be saved by denying the Spirit. Man will only learn to respect nature if the Spirit of God is set free in him in a gesture of pure love.⁸⁴

Rather than pursue a negative view of humanity in the ecological picture, Pope Benedict XVI's view is that humanity is fundamentally good,⁸⁵ and has a unique role in protecting creation. With that, however, comes a heightened moral responsibility.⁸⁶ He remarks that:

⁸⁴ SEEKING GOD'S FACE, *supra* note 48, at 57-58. For a similar account of the lessons to be learned from St. Francis about the intertwining obligations to respect humanity and creation, see SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 131-32:

[T]his story [of St. Francis] contains none of the bitterness against human beings (for their alleged interference in nature), such as one detects in so many conservationist manifestos today. When man himself is out of joint and can no longer affirm himself, nature cannot flourish. On the contrary: man must first be in harmony with creation and it with him. And this is only possible if he is in harmony with the Creator who designed both nature and us. Respect for man and respect for nature go together, but ultimately both can only flourish and find their true measure if, in man and nature, we respect the Creator and his creation. The two only harmonize in relationship with the Creator. We shall assuredly never find the lost equilibrium if we refuse to press forward and discover this relationship.

For a related discussion of the connections between human harmony and creation, see Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, Rome, June 5, 2005 ("I hope that sport practised in a healthy and armonious way at all levels will encourage brotherhood and solidarity between people as well as respect and an appreciation of the natural environment.")

⁸⁵ See IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 43 ("The human being has not been formed from negative forces, but has been fashioned from God's good earth."); *Id.* at 95 ("Christian love presupposes faith in the Creator. It must include acceptance of myself as his creature and love of the Creator's creation in me."); *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶8 ("At creation itself, man was called to have some share in God's breath of life."); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI on His Pastoral Visit to the Roman Parish of Dio Padre Misericordioso*, Rome, March 26, 2006 ("[W]e have all been created and redeemed by a God who sacrificed his only Son out of love.").

⁸⁶ See GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 119 ("I think that the greatness of man is more obvious to us nowadays than ever before—and, of course, also the danger of

Man is indeed a kind of bridge. He is the point at which the material world and the spiritual world meet and mingle and thus occupies a special place in the matrix of the created order. . . . That gives him a quite special function: that is to say, sharing the responsibility for the unity of creation, incarnating spirit in himself and, conversely, lifting material being up to God—and, thereby, all in all, making a contribution to the great symphony of creation.⁸⁷

Others have written far more extensively than Pope Benedict XVI on the theme of stewardship as a proper role for mankind *vis a vis* creation.⁸⁸ Indeed, this is a theme that is not yet extensively developed in his writing.⁸⁹ Instead, his theology speaks of a special role for humanity based on mankind's unique status and close relationship both to God and to the natural world. Pope Benedict XVI has preached that "in the

falling from greatness. For the greater a creature is, the greater the danger it runs."); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 48 ("[T]o the question as to what distinguishes the human being from an animal . . . the answer has to be that they are the beings that God made capable of thinking and praying. They are most profoundly themselves when they discover their relation to their Creator. . . . [H]uman persons are beings of word and of love, beings moving toward Another, oriented to giving themselves to the Other, and only truly receiving themselves back in real self-giving."); RATZINGER REPORT, *supra* note 71, at 98 ("To respect biology is to respect God himself, hence to safeguard his creatures."); Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, Rome, December 24, 2006 ("[W]e are precious and unique in the eyes of the Creator."); *Venezuela Address*, *supra* note 72:

Venezuela has been wonderfully endowed by the Creator with natural resources. This brings with it the responsibility to cultivate and care for the gifts received, so that all its inhabitants may have the possibility of living with the dignity that befits human beings. In this task, no one may feel exempt from active collaboration, especially in cases of poverty or social marginalization.

⁸⁷ GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 89.

⁸⁸ Pope Benedict XVI himself recognized this lengthy tradition in his very first Advent *Angelus* address when he quoted the stewardship theme as articulated in the landmark Vatican II document, *Gaudium et Spes*. In his remarks, Pope Benedict XVI says, "I am referring in particular to [that section of *Gaudium et Spes* in which] . . . we read: 'We are taught that God is preparing a new dwelling and a new earth. . . . Far from diminishing our concern to develop this earth, the expectancy of a new earth should spur us on, for it is here that the body of a new human family grows.'" Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, St. Peter's Square, November 27, 2005.

⁸⁹ However, the stewardship theme *is* being mentioned increasingly more often in some of Pope Benedict's more recent statements. See, e.g., Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, February 5, 2006 ("Man is not the master of life; rather, he is its custodian and steward, and under God's primacy, this priority of administering and preserving human life, created by God, comes automatically into being. The truth that man is the custodian and steward of life is a clearly defined point of natural law, fully illumined by biblical revelation."); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Eucharistic Celebration for all Workers on the Feast of Saint Joseph*, Rome, March 19, 2006 ("When the Creator shaped man in his image and likeness, he asked him to till the land.").

human being, heaven and earth touch one another. In the human being God enters into his creation; the human being is directly related to God.”⁹⁰

He remarks that “the human person . . . is the only one of all the creatures on this earth who can establish a free and conscious relationship with his or her creator.”⁹¹ Thus, any environmental proposals or ideologies that would undermine the central dignity of the human would run counter to Pope Benedict XVI’s vision.⁹² Thus, those envi-

⁹⁰ SPIRITUAL VISION, *supra* note 45, at 104. *See also* GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 77 (“God intended us to live in inner harmony with creation, as well as in the security represented by life with Him. . . . [T]hese two conditions, being guardian of creation and being in direct contact with God, so as to carry on the work of creation with him . . . are suggested.”); IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 38 (“[W]e can be really ‘creative’ only if we are in harmony with the creator of the universe. We can really serve the earth only if we accept it under the aegis of God’s Word.”); and *Id.* at 39 (“[O]nly if we trust the Creator shall we find ourselves on the way to saving the world of human beings and of things.”). *See also* Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Pontifical Academy of Sciences and the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences*, Rome, November 21, 2005:

Humans are part of nature and, yet, as free subjects who have moral and spiritual values, they transcend nature. This anthropological reality is an integral part of Christian thought and responds directly to the attempts to abolish the boundary between human sciences and natural sciences, often proposed in contemporary society. . . . God created man and woman in his own image and likeness and granted them a superior dignity and a shared mission towards the whole of creation.

⁹¹ Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, St. Peter’s Square, December 4, 2005. This distinction between humanity and other creatures is described again, in a different context, when Pope Benedict explains, “The biblical account of creation speaks of the solitude of Adam. . . . Of all other creatures, not one is capable of being the helper that man needs, even though he has assigned a name to all the wild beasts and birds and thus made them fully a part of his life.” *Deus Caritas Est*, *supra* note 31, ¶ 11.

⁹² *See* Pope Benedict XVI, *Meeting with the Diplomatic Corps to the Republic of Turkey, Address of the Holy Father*, Ankara, November 28, 2006:

The voice of the Church on the diplomatic scene is always characterized by the Gospel commitment to serve the cause of humanity, and I would be failing in this fundamental obligation if I did not remind you of the need always to place human dignity at the very heart of our concerns. The world is experiencing an extraordinary development of science and technology, with almost immediate consequences for medicine, agriculture and food production, but also for the communication of knowledge; this process must not lack direction or a human point of reference, when it relates to birth, education, manner of life or work, of old age, or death. It is necessary to re-position modern progress within the continuity of our human history and thus to guide it according to the plan written into our nature for the growth of humanity—a plan expressed by the words of the book of Genesis as follows: “Be fruitful, multiply, fill the earth and subdue it.”

Pope Benedict XVI echoed a similar theme in his remarks concerning the challenges facing Latin America in which he lamented “increasing poverty and ecological deterio-

ronmental initiatives that focus on population control as a remedy for environmental ills would be condemned as they do not respect the central dignity of the human person. Likewise, those plans that do not offer sufficient recognition of the human need to farm, build, earn a livelihood, and use natural resources to support a family would be subject to critical review. This is particularly true in the poorer regions of the world, where immediate human needs are both urgent and complex.⁹³

Pope Benedict XVI highlighted the centrality of the human person in a recent statement to the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization, when he commented that “[t]rue progress is that alone which integrally safeguards the dignity of the human being and which enables each people to share its own spiritual and material resources for the benefit of all.”⁹⁴

Soon after the start of Pope Benedict XVI’s papacy, the first-ever Working Group on Water and the Environment was sponsored by the Pontifical Academy of Sciences. In addressing the goal of the workshop, it was stated that, when it comes to problems with the quality and quantity of clean water:

ration, especially in the large cities.” Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Participants in the Plenary Assembly of the Pontifical Commission for Latin America*, January 20, 2007.

⁹³ For a fuller discussion of this complex problem, in the context of impoverished rural areas see Pope Benedict XVI, *Message of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Director General of the Food and Agriculture Organization for the Celebration of World Food Day*, October 16, 2006. Pope Benedict XVI warned that, “[n]ot enough energy is given to the needs of agriculture, and this both upsets the natural order of creation and compromises respect for human dignity.” He goes on to lament:

Very often, international action to combat hunger ignores the human factor, and priority is given instead to technical and socio-economic aspects. Local communities need to be involved in choices and decisions concerning land use, since farmland is being diverted increasingly to other purposes, often with damaging effects on the environment and the long-term viability of the land.

The order of creation demands that priority be given to those human activities that do not cause irreversible damage to nature, but which instead are woven into the social, cultural, and religious fabric of the different communities. In this way, a sober balance is achieved between consumption and the sustainability of resources.

Id.

⁹⁴ Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Participants in the Thirty-Third Conference of the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization*, November 24, 2005 [hereinafter “*Food and Agriculture Organization Address*.”]. See also *id.* (“Humanity is presently experiencing a worrisome paradox: side by side with ever new and positive advances in the areas of economy, science and technology, we are witnessing a continuing increase of poverty.”).

[W]e can say that the problem has two main facets: the first belongs especially to the natural sciences (study the great basins, conserve them and develop them in a sustainable way with relation to the rest of the environment); the second facet pertains more to the social sciences (fair distribution of water).⁹⁵

Access to water was again highlighted as a concern of the Holy See as it participated in the Fourth World Water Forum in Mexico City in March, 2006. Although the contribution to the Forum was prepared by the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace, and not written by Pope Benedict XVI himself, the themes it articulates reiterate themes dear to the heart of Pope Benedict XVI. First, it praises the gift of water from the Creator, and expresses the obligation to use this gift, as well as other gifts of creation, for the common good:

Water is a natural resource vital for the survival of humanity and all species on earth. As a good of creation, water is destined for all human beings and their communities. God intended the earth and all it contains for the use of all, so that all created things would be shared, fairly, by humankind under the guidance of justice tempered by charity. . . . Water is a universal common good, a common good of the entire human family. . . . This natural resource must be equitably at the disposal of the entire human family.⁹⁶

The document also echoes Pope Benedict XVI's concern for placing human rights at the center of ecological discussions. It argues, "[d]efining access to safe water as a human right is an important step in making this access a reality in the lives of many people living in poverty. A rights based approach places the human being at the center of development."⁹⁷ This link between water and human dignity shows the pri-

⁹⁵ Pontifical Academy of Sciences, Working Group on Water and the Environment, *Conference Brochure*, November 12-14, 2005 at 3 (on file with author). For additional background on this Working Group, see, e.g., John Thavis, *Scientists, Ethicists Say Water is Essential Resource of the Future*, CATHOLIC NEWS SERVICE, November 15, 2005 (www.catholicnews.com/data/stories/cns/0506530.html); Angelina Sciolla, *Vatican, Scientists Consider World's Water Rights*, SCIENCE & THEOLOGY NEWS, January 18, 2006 (www.stnews.org/News-2577.html). See also Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of the Holy Father*, Istanbul, December 1, 2006 (decrying "a world where men are so loath to share the earth's goods and there is a dramatic shortage of water, the good so precious for the life of the body").

⁹⁶ Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace, *Water, An Essential Element for Life: A Contribution of the Holy See to the Fourth World Water Forum*, Mexico City, March 16-22, 2006. [hereinafter "An Essential Element of Life."]

⁹⁷ *Id.* at 96. In addition, this document explores more fully the link between access to clean water and the existence—or lack, thereof—of world peace. It warns, "[c]onflicts have already occurred for control over water resources, and others may come center stage the more water scarcity manifests its consequences on the lives of human beings and their communities." *Id.* See also *id.* ("The vital importance of water to humanity

ority that this issue will be given, since it does not place humans in conflict with the natural environment but, instead, sees the good of one intertwined with the good of the other.⁹⁸

Pope Benedict XVI is likely to encourage environmentalists to focus on the connection between human need and the natural world, rather than the real or perceived opposition between them. Water is but one timely illustration of these issues likely to gain attention because it marries both human need and ecological concerns. Thus, a very clear fourth element of Pope Benedict XVI's ecological thought is ensuring that the proper role of humanity is respected in all decision making.

IV. A View to the Future

*"We can win the future only if we do not lose creation."*⁹⁹

In many respects, it is difficult to predict the exact role that Pope Benedict XVI will play in the further development of Catholic social teaching in the area of environmental ethics. As the previous discussion illustrates, however, he has already devoted considerable thought to this question. Unlike his predecessor who welcomed—and, at times, seemed to relish—a role on the world stage, Pope Benedict XVI appears to be a bit more ambivalent about the intervention of the Church in detailed policy-making. To illustrate this tension, he has written, "the Church must make claims and demands on public law, and cannot

means also that it is a strategic factor for the establishment and maintenance of peace in the world."); *Id.* ("To foster peace and an appropriate level of security in the current world situation governments and international organizations will inevitably have to increase efforts to ensure that every person has access to safe water.").

⁹⁸ See *id.* ("[C]ommon agreement exists that the survival of humanity and all species on earth depends to a great degree on the fate of water."); *Id.* ("Water is much more than just a basic human need. It is an essential, irreplaceable element to ensuring the continuance of life. Water is extrinsically linked to fundamental human rights, such as the right to life, to food, and to health."); *Id.* ("The human being is the center of the concern expressed in this updated document. Solutions for access to safe water and sanitation should express a preferential love and consideration for the poor. . . . The water issue is truly a right to life issue."). A similar theme was developed in an ecumenical reflection as well. See *Common Declaration Signed by Pope Benedict XVI and H.B. Christolodoulos, Archbishop of Athens and All Greece*, December 14, 2006:

[I]t is . . . important not to exploit or abuse creation, which is the work of God. In this regard, we appeal to social leaders and to all people of good will to engage in a reasonable and respectful stewardship of creation, so that it may be correctly administered in a spirit of solidarity, especially for the sake of the peoples afflicted by famine, so as to bequeath to future generations a world that is truly inhabitable for everyone.

⁹⁹ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 100.

simply retreat into the private sphere. . . . [I]t must also take care on the other hand that Church and State remain separated.”¹⁰⁰ This tension between the roles of public authorities and private individuals is likely to influence the approach Pope Benedict XVI takes toward environmental teachings.

Pope Benedict XVI’s writings underscore the fact that environmental protection includes a significant component of *personal* moral responsibility,¹⁰¹ criticizing the way in which “we do not lay our hands on the earth, hands that so often exploit and violate it.”¹⁰² A critical component of this moral obligation, as articulated by Pope Benedict XVI, is the need to turn away from destructive and careless consumerism. As he has written,

Nature resists unbridled consumption, and this is why the state of the environment has prompted new reflections on the direction that nature itself indicates. The lordship over nature of which the biblical creation narrative speaks does not mean a violent exploitation of nature but, rather an understanding of nature’s inherent possibilities. This suggests a caution in the way in which we serve nature and nature serves us.¹⁰³

Unlike his predecessor, however, Pope Benedict XVI has not yet written extensively about the moral responsibility that may exist for *governmental entities*, either national or international. Much could be said about the moral responsibility of wealthy nations to poor ones, or of international organizations to the nations they serve. Pope Benedict XVI has hinted at this when he wrote that “[t]he earth, in fact, can produce enough to nourish all its inhabitants on the condition that the rich countries do not keep for themselves what belongs to all.”¹⁰⁴ He has

¹⁰⁰ SPIRITUAL VISION, *supra* note 45, at 131.

¹⁰¹ See, e.g., PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP, *supra* note 28, at 296-97 (“[B]ecause God is love, that is why the Commandments, in which his will is made known, are the essential variations of the single theme of love. They are the practical rules of love for God, for my neighbor, for creation, for ourselves.”); *Sacramentum Caritatis*, *supra* note 26, at ¶92 (“The justified concern about threats to the environment present in so many part of the world is reinforced by Christian hope, which commits us to working responsibly for the protection of creation.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Message of His Holiness Benedict XVI for Lent 2006*, September 29, 2005 (“Even in this era of global interdependence, it is clear that no economic, social or political project can replace that gift of self to another through which charity is expressed.”).

¹⁰² THE FEAST OF FAITH, *supra* note 26, at 135.

¹⁰³ VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL, *supra* note 61, at 159.

¹⁰⁴ Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Presentation of the Letters Accrediting New Ambassadors to the Holy See*, Rome, June 16, 2005. Pope Benedict XVI echoed a similar theme when he lamented:

also begun to make several practical suggestions with regard to agricultural support.¹⁰⁵

However, to date, this realm of detailed governmental policy is not where he has placed his emphasis. Instead, thus far, his writings are largely devoted to the moral obligations of *individuals* to respect creation.¹⁰⁶ He has said, for example, in a slightly different context, “It is easier to demonstrate for the rights and freedoms of one’s own group than to practice in daily living the discipline of freedom and the patience of love for those who suffer, or, indeed, to bind oneself to such service for the whole of one’s life, with the concomitant renunciation of a great part of one’s own individual freedoms.”¹⁰⁷ He has identified the moral problem to be one of misplaced priorities and values, saying “we

The traditional biblical fullness of food and years, considered a sign of divine blessing, is now countered by an intolerable satiety composed of an excessive load of humiliations. And we know today that many nations, many individuals, are truly burdened with derision, with the contempt of the rich and the disdain of the proud.

Pope Benedict XVI, *General Audience*, Rome, June 15, 2005. *See also* GOD AND THE WORLD, *supra* note 30, at 430 (“When I think . . . that in Europe they pay farmers subsidies to kill off their livestock, to destroy grain crops, grapes, all kinds of fruit, because we supposedly cannot control overproduction, then it seems to me that these knowledgeable managers ought still to reflect on how, instead of destroying these gifts of creation, we could make good use of them all.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Urbi et Orbi Message of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI*, Rome, December 25, 2006 (“People continue to die of hunger and thirst, disease and poverty, in this age of plenty and of unbridled enthusiasm.”).

¹⁰⁵ *See, e.g., Food and Agriculture Organization Address, supra* note 94:

It must not be forgotten that the vulnerability of rural areas has significant repercussions on the subsistence of small farmers and their families if they are denied access to the market. A consistent course of action would call for recognizing the essential role of the rural family as a guardian of values and a natural agent of solidarity in relationships between the generations.

¹⁰⁶ Indeed, this is the view he has articulated with regard to individual obligations in the social realm more generally. In *Deus Caritas Est*, he said simply, “We contribute to a better world only by personally doing good now.” *Deus Caritas Est, supra* note 31, at ¶ 31(b). *See also Amazon River Letter, supra* note 25 (discussing the personal “commitments of each one to safeguard the habitat that the Creator has made available to the human being, in whom he has impressed his own image.”).

¹⁰⁷ A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 26. *See also id.* at 73:

The gift of the Law is the real establishment of liberation—and of a Law that is truly justice, namely right order in relationship to one another, in relationship to creation, and in relationship to the Creator. Man’s freedom can exist only in the correct mutual allocation of these freedoms.

A similar theme was echoed in GOSPEL, CATECHESIS, CATECHISM, *supra* note 27, at 12:

While it is certainly neither possible nor desirable to live by prohibitions and accusations, the question about our duty as human beings, about the land of life required for the rectitude of our own being and the being of the world, is the essential question of every age.

are embarrassed by the way the human spirit has misused matter and creation. But such misuse comes precisely through *things* being given priority over the *person*.”¹⁰⁸

Clearly, Pope Benedict XVI acknowledges that there is a role for the Church in the affairs of the world and in bettering the human condition by playing a part in the public square.¹⁰⁹ Indeed, in his first homily to the Synod of Bishops in October of 2005, he lamented that there is a modern perception that

God is in our way. Either he is reduced merely to a few devout words, or he is denied in everything and banned from public life so as to lose all meaning. The tolerance that admits God . . . as a private opinion but refuses him the public domain, the reality of the world and of our lives is not tolerance but hypocrisy.”¹¹⁰

¹⁰⁸ SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 47. *See also id.* at 103 (“Today, by progress we generally mean the growth in the scope of technology and the increase in the gross national product. When we say progress, quite simply, we think of ‘having’ more.”). *See also 2006 World Youth Day Homily*, *supra* note 45 (speaking of the need for “inner freedom from the greed for possession and the mania for power.”).

¹⁰⁹ *See, e.g.,* PILGRIM FELLOWSHIP, *supra* note 28, at 286 (“The Church is there to prevent the advance of hell on earth and to make the earth fit to live in through the light of God.”); *Id.* at 287 (“The Church is there . . . for mankind. She is there so that the world may become a sphere for God’s presence, the sphere of the covenant between God and man.”); *Deus Caritas Est*, *supra* note 31, at ¶ 28(a) (“[T]he Church is duty—bound to offer, through the purification of reason and through ethical formation, her own specific contribution towards understanding the requirements of justice and achieving them politically. . . . She cannot and must not replace the State. Yet at the same time she cannot and must not remain on the sidelines in the fight for justice. She has to play her part through rational argument and she has to reawaken the spiritual energy without which justice, which always demands sacrifice, cannot prevail and prosper.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *First Message of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the End of the Eucharistic Concelebration with the Members of the College of Cardinals*, Sistine Chapel, April 20, 2005 (“I . . . declare the willingness of all Catholics to cooperate for an authentic social development, respectful of the dignity of every human being.”); MANY RELIGIONS, *supra* note 66, at 102 (“This refusal to turn religion into political moralism does not mean, of course, that education for peace, justice, and love for the Creator and creation are not part and parcel of the task of the Christian faith and of every religion.”); and Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Diplomatic Corps Accredited to the Holy See*, Rome, May 12, 2005:

[T]he Church never ceases to proclaim and defend the fundamental human rights, which unfortunately are still violated in various parts of the earth. She is working for recognition of the rights of every human person to life, food, a home, work, health-care assistance, the protection of the family and the promotion of social development, with respect for the dignity of men and women, created in the image of God.

¹¹⁰ *Synod Opening Homily*, *supra* note 53.

In addition, in his public prayers, he preached that “faith cannot be reduced to a private sentiment or indeed, be hidden when it is inconvenient; it also implies consistency and a witness even in the public arena for the sake of human beings, justice, and truth.”¹¹¹ He has also commented that solidarity between different nations is essential in setting policies that will be just internationally.¹¹² This may suggest that, with time, the scope of Pope Benedict XVI’s teaching on the role of the Church in the public square will expand, and his direct involvement in environmental debates will increase.

¹¹¹ Pope Benedict XVI, *Angelus*, St. Peter’s Square, October 9, 2005. *See also* A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 56:

Alongside this primary task of creating conviction, forming conscience, and fashioning community as a space for peace is the mission of the Church’s office bearers, supported by the conviction of the faithful, to speak out publicly on questions of the moment and to be advocates of peace. In our own times, this has been taken up with much passion.

See also JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, CALLED TO COMMUNION: UNDERSTANDING THE CHURCH TODAY 101 (TRANS: ADRIAN WALKER) (1996):

[T]he bishop also has a responsibility for the public affairs of this world. The state is entitled to autonomy with respect to the Church, and the bishop must acknowledge that the state has its own reality and law. He avoids mixing faith and politics and serves the freedom of all by refusing to allow faith to be identified with a particular form of politics. The Gospel prescribes certain truths and values to politics, but it does not respond to concrete questions concerning particular political and economic issues.

¹¹² SPIRITUAL VISION, *supra* note 45, at 128 (“Justice is no longer to be circumscribed by the boundaries of one country. North and South, rich nation and poor, form one world in which the fate of one group is not to be separated from that of another. . . . Only when we keep in mind the justice of the whole world can we rightfully discern what justice means for us here and now.”); 2006 World Youth Day Homily, *supra* note 45 (noting that Christ “comes in all cultures and all parts of the world, everywhere, in wretched huts and in poor rural areas as well as in the splendour of cathedrals. He is the same everywhere, the One, and thus all thou gathered with him in prayer and communion are also united in one body.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Letter of His Holiness Benedict XVI to Cardinal Walter Kasper on the Occasion of the Second Conference on Peace and Tolerance*, November 4, 2005:

It is the duty of every person of good will, and especially of every believer, to help build a peaceful society and to overcome the temptation towards aggressive and futile confrontation between different cultures and ethnic groups. Each of the world’s peoples has a responsibility to make its own particular contribution to peace and harmony by placing its spiritual and cultural heritage and its ethical values at the service of the human family throughout the world. This goal can only be achieved if at the heart of the economic, social, and cultural development of each community is a proper respect for life and for the dignity of every human person. A healthy society always promotes respect for the inviolable and inalienable rights of all people.

See also *Deus Caritas Est*, *supra* note 31, at ¶ 26 (“[T]he pursuit of justice must be a fundamental norm of the State and . . . the aim of a just social order is to guarantee to each person, according to the principle of subsidiarity, his share of the community’s goods.”).

Yet, Pope Benedict XVI is also wary of the Church's reach into those areas that are within the scope of lay expertise and prudential judgment,¹¹³ and he is cautious about an overly civic role for the Church. Indeed, he warns that "the Church does less, not more, for peace if she abandons her own sphere of faith, education, witness, counsel, prayer, and serving love, and changes into an organization for direct political action. . . . Only when she respects her limits is she limitless."¹¹⁴ This is particularly true in the area of ecology, which involves not only lay political expertise but scientific knowledge as well.¹¹⁵ He has written, "Scripture would not wish to inform us about how the different species of plant life gradually appeared or how the sun and the moon and the stars were established. Its ultimate purpose would be to say one thing: *God created the world.*"¹¹⁶ In his writings, he has warned:

Of course, our efforts on behalf of peace, justice, and the protection of creation are of the highest importance and religion should doubtlessly provide a vehicle for substantial action in this regard. But the religions have no *a priori* knowledge

¹¹³ See A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 8:

It has become clear that one cannot plan and shape the future of mankind while prescind from religion. This process gives comfort to faith, but faith will not fail to recognize at the same time the dangers inherent in it, for the temptation is obvious on all sides to take in religion as an instrument to serve political ideas.

¹¹⁴ *Id.* at 59. See also *id.* at 57 ("No social service of the state can replace Christian love in both its spontaneous and organized forms."); *Id.* at 157 ("Religion that has turned into politics makes excessive demands of politics and thereby becomes a source of the disintegration of man and society."); SPIRITUAL VISION, *supra* note 45, at 87 ("[T]he Kingdom of God is not a thing, a social or political structure, a Utopia. The Kingdom of God is God."); and *Id.* at 111 ("[T]he price of faith's union with political power is always paid in the end when faith is placed at the service of power and must bow to its criteria.").

¹¹⁵ See, e.g., THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS OF VATICAN II, *supra* note 62, at 162 ("[F]aith offers men directive guidance about their origin and destiny. But this does not mean that the Church has ready answers for all specific questions. Rather, the Church links its own search—a search for faith—with the search of mankind for solutions to these specific problems."). See also FAITH & THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 5:

The difficulty begins with the very first page of the Bible. The concept presented there of how the world came to be, is in direct contradiction of a what we know today about the origins of the universe; and even if the word has gotten around that these passages in the Bible are not meant to be a textbook of natural science, and so need not be taken as a literal description of how the universe came to be, still an uneasy feeling remains.

¹¹⁶ IN THE BEGINNING, *supra* note 1, at 5. A similar point was made in JOSEPH RATZINGER, INTRODUCTION TO CHRISTIANITY 103 (1985) (J.R. FOSTER, TRANS) ("For all the uncertainties about its origins, we can at any rate see that . . . God [is] the Lord of heaven and earth' . . . the Lord to whom the stars too belong, alongside whom the stars cannot exist as independent divine powers.").

of . . . how creation can best be protected and cultivated out of a sense of responsibility to the creator. All these things must be worked out rationally and on an individual basis. This always requires free debate between differing opinions and respect for different paths. Often, this pluralism of paths cannot be resolved, and if the wearying rational debate is cut short by a religiously motivated moralism that declares one path to be the only right one, religion is perverted into an ideological dictatorship, with a totalitarian passion that does not build peace by destroys it. Religion cannot be forced into the service of practical-political objectives; the latter would become an idol; man, making God the slave of his plans, would degrade both God and himself.¹¹⁷

This would suggest that Pope Benedict XVI may be more likely to direct his attention on ecological matters toward the moral education of individuals rather than governments. Whether or not this changes will be one important facet of his developing role on the world stage beyond Europe where, to date, most of his energy has been directed.

Nevertheless, on January 1, 2007, Pope Benedict XVI—like his predecessor, Pope John Paul II—used the occasion of the World Day of Peace message to offer an extensive reflection on ecology and obligations toward creation. This message, in an important way, marked his formal “debut” on the environmental scene, and demonstrates his ecological priorities as pope rather than as theologian. In his message, *The Human Person, the Heart of Peace*,¹¹⁸ Pope Benedict XVI devoted an entire section of his reflections to a discussion of what he termed “the ‘ecology of peace.’”¹¹⁹ In this discussion, he links care for the environment and care for humanity, and argues that disrespect for the environment often reflects precisely those human failings that threaten human peace. He reflected:

[H]umanity, if it truly desires peace, must be increasingly conscious of the links between natural ecology, or respect for nature, and human ecology. Experience shows that *disregard for the environment always harms human coexistence, and vice versa*. It becomes more and more evident that there is an inseparable link between peace with creation and peace among men. Both of these presuppose peace with God.¹²⁰

¹¹⁷ MANY RELIGIONS, *supra* note 66, at 101-102. *See also* A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 57 (“What the Church has to remember is that, though the sources of law have been entrusted to her safekeeping, she does not have any specific answers to concrete political questions. She must not make herself out to be the sole possessor of political reason. She points out paths for reason to follow, and yet reason’s own responsibilities remain.”); and *Deus Caritas Est*, *supra* note 31, at ¶ 29 (“The direct duty to work for a just ordering of society . . . is proper to the lay faithful.”).

¹¹⁸ Pope Benedict XVI, *Message of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI for the Celebration of the World Day of Peace: Human Person, the Heart of Peace*, January 1, 2007.

¹¹⁹ *Id.*, ¶ 8 *et seq.*

¹²⁰ *Id.*, ¶ 8 (emphasis original).

While prior papal writings have linked environmental degradation to threats to human development and economic well-being, the direct link to *peace* is a more recent argument. Pope Benedict XVI develops this link more fully as he articulates at least two specific ways in which threats to the natural environment can quickly lead to threats to human peace.

First, he warns, the fight over access to declining energy resources poses a growing threat to peace. He fears that the “increasingly serious problem of energy supplies”¹²¹ is one that may erupt in human conflict:

In recent years, new nations have entered enthusiastically into industrial production, thereby increasing their energy needs. This has led to an unprecedented race for available resources. Meanwhile, some parts of the planet remain backward and developmentally blocked, partly because of the rise in energy prices. What will happen to these peoples? What kind of development or non-development will be imposed on them by the scarcity of energy supplies? What injustices and conflicts will be provoked by the race for energy sources? And what will be the reaction of those who are excluded from this race? These are questions that show how respect for nature is closely linked to the need to establish, between individuals and between nations, relationships that are attentive to the dignity of the person and capable of satisfying his or her authentic needs.¹²²

As he has done in the past, Pope Benedict XVI connected environmental affairs to human affairs and—in tension with some others in the environmental movement—suggests that a primary rationale for creation care is to avoid harm to humanity. Unlike his past writings, however, this specific identification of energy conflicts has a high degree of detail.

A second link between the natural environment and human peace is made when Pope Benedict XVI argues that the exploitation of the environment can lead to the degradation of humanity to a degree that may result in destruction and violence:

The destruction of the environment, its improper or selfish use, and the violent hoarding of the earth’s resources cause grievances, conflicts and wars, precisely because they are the consequences of an inhumane concept of development. Indeed, if development were limited to the technical-economic aspects, obscuring the moral-religious dimension, it would not be an integral human development, but a one-sided distortion which would end up by unleashing man’s destructive capacities.¹²³

¹²¹ *Id.*, ¶ 9.

¹²² *Id.*, ¶ 9.

¹²³ *Id.*

This is a more traditional critique of the link between environmental concern and human development. It is, however, a warning as to the concern that must be paid to the environmental harms that can lead to destruction to the human family.

In addition to these two specific discussions of the link between ecology and peace, Pope Benedict XVI also used the 2007 World Day of Peace statement to mention several other ways in which peace may be threatened by human indifference to the environment. He decried “inequality in access to essential goods like food, water. . . .,”¹²⁴ and reiterated the familiar concern about the harm that nuclear weaponry could pose to creation.¹²⁵

This was not the first time that Pope Benedict XVI has addressed the connection between the environment and peace. He has, in the past, commented on the potential for harm that is posed by warfare¹²⁶ and nuclear weaponry.¹²⁷ He has previously warned that “[t]he first threat to peace . . . is the danger of the world war, the danger that the greater power blocks, into which the world is divided, would unleash against

¹²⁴ *Id.*, ¶ 6.

¹²⁵ *Id.*, ¶ 15:

Another disturbing issue is the desire recently shown by some states to acquire nuclear weapons. This has heightened even more the widespread climate of uncertainty and fear of a possible atomic catastrophe. We are brought back in time to the profound anxieties of the “cold war” period. . . . Unfortunately, threatening clouds continue to gather on humanity’s horizon.

¹²⁶ See, e.g., FAITH AND THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 85 (“[The] same technical skill which offers such opportunities to humanity offers also fresh opportunities to him who is anti-humane. There is no need to speak of the ultimate horrors of atomic weapons, and of biological and chemical warfare, although the store of terror they imply always lurks somewhere in our minds.”); and VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL, *supra* note 61, at 31 (“[T]he development of man’s power to create and to destroy poses much more acutely than before the question of the legal and ethical controls on this power.”).

¹²⁷ See A NEW SONG FOR THE LORD, *supra* note 33, at 37-38:

[T]here is a fear of the danger arising from humanity’s arsenals of weapons that were again created to demonstrate the power of one state over another but now seem to be expanding further with compulsive dynamism so that the question of whether they can be controlled by governments has become urgent. Even with the hopes for disarmament growing anew, we still fear the automated nature of this machinery and the danger of its setting itself off.

See also VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL, *supra* note 61, at 106 (“Since both terror and organized crime, which is spreading its net ever more widely and strongly, could conceivably get access to atomic and biological weapons, the peril that looms here is terrifying.”); Pope Benedict XVI, *Message of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI for the Celebration of the World Day of Peace*, January 1, 2006 (“In a nuclear war, there would be no victors, only victims.”).

each other those weapons of mass destruction that in all probability would bring about the destruction of the human race.”¹²⁸ Pope Benedict XVI, of course, is not the first pontiff to be concerned about this issue, and he has praised his predecessors for their attention to this problem decades ago.¹²⁹ Although he offers no particular solutions to this problem, it is noteworthy that he has identified this particular concern. Given the current state of world events, it is likely that the ecological damage resulting from conventional and modern warfare will become a very real issue during the papacy of Pope Benedict XVI.¹³⁰ As he has warned:

Science is an immensely good thing precisely because it is a controlled form of rationality that is confirmed by experience. But there exist also pathological forms of science that deprive man of all honor, when scientific capabilities are put at the service of power. Science can also serve inhumanity! Here we may recall the weapons of mass destruction . . .¹³¹

Naturally, pursuit of peace for its own sake is a worthy goal for myriad reasons unconnected to ecological well being. However, Pope Benedict XVI has also identified the lack of peace as an environmental threat as well.

This early emphasis on ecological concerns attracted the attention of commentators,¹³² and may signal that there may be future statements

¹²⁸ A TURNING POINT FOR EUROPE, *supra* note 55, at 42. *See also* Pope Benedict XVI, *Homily of His Holiness Benedict XVI*, Rome, January 1, 2007:

In the face of the threats to peace that are unfortunately ever present, the situations of injustice and violence that persist in various areas of the earth and the continuing armed conflicts often overlooked by the majority of public opinion, as well as the danger of terrorism that clouds the serenity of peoples.

¹²⁹ *See* THEOLOGICAL HIGHLIGHTS, *supra* note 62, at 102 (“[T]he frankness, the sober seriousness, the courage and objectivity of the bishops who spoke on such delicate questions as . . . atomic warfare all had a healthy effect.”).

¹³⁰ Interestingly, Pope Benedict recently addressed another, oft-neglected casualty of war and ecological catastrophe: the mental health consequences on victims. *See* Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Sick at the End of the Mass for the Sick*, February 11, 2006 (“[N]atural disasters or, unfortunately, wars and armed conflicts are producing in people serious psychological traumas.”).

¹³¹ VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL, *supra* note 61, at 26.

¹³² *See, e.g.,* Ian Fisher, *Pope Benedict XVI Issues Annual Message for Peace*, INTERNATIONAL HERALD TRIBUNE EUROPE, December 12, 2006 (available on line at [www.ihf.com/articles/2006/for peace, Pope 12/12/news/pope.php](http://www.ihf.com/articles/2006/for%20peace,%20Pope%2012/12/news/pope.php).) (“In an annual message for peace, Benedict strongly emphasized a theme rarely taken up in his nearly two years as pope: what he called the ‘ecology of peace,’ the idea that protecting the environment and finding alternate energy sources could also reduce conflict.”); Gerard O’Connell, *Pope Benedict XVI’s Peace Day Message Identifies Triple Danger*, CATHOLIC NEWS SER-

from Pope Benedict XVI that follow up on the themes he raised in these remarks.

As Pope Benedict XVI's papacy continues, it will be interesting to observe the way in which he works with those who are in the forefront of environmental activism, but have often been at odds with the Church on theological matters.¹³³ It remains to be seen how the traditional conflicts between these movements and with the Church's environmental intervention will be undertaken.¹³⁴ He has warned against traditional political affiliations, cautioning that in the future the church will be "flirting as little with the left as with the right."¹³⁵ However, the ways in which relationships with these diverse groups will be developed remains to be seen. These conflicts are more likely to come to the forefront if and when there are major secular conferences on the environment in which the Holy See participates.

In addition, it remains to be seen which specific issues arise in the next few years that may involve the intervention of the Holy See on ecological matters. More generally, Pope Benedict XVI has identified the pressing issues of our time to be "witness to the One God and his commandments, the sanctity of life, the promotion of human dignity, the rights of the family, and the need to build a world of justice, reconciliation and peace for future generations."¹³⁶ Thus, it is likely that

VICE, December 13, 2006 (available on line at www.catholic.org/international/international_story.php) ("According to Pope Benedict XVI, the three major threats to world peace today are nuclear weapons, the unprecedented race for energy resources and the lack of respect for human rights."); Joe Sinasac, *On Being Green*, THE CATHOLIC REGISTER, February 2, 2007 ("Pope Benedict XVI in his annual World Day of Peace message also drew links between proper ecological stewardship and our responsibility to each other."); *Id.* ("Pope Benedict XVI becomes even more pointed, challenging the world to curb its appetite for energy resources or reap the whirlwind."); and Paul Majendie, *God Turns Green*, GELONG ADVERTISER, February 10, 2007 at 40 ("Pope Benedict XVI has called on every Catholic to become environmentally friendly and dedicated an entire section of his 2007 World Day of Peace message to what he called 'the ecology of peace.'").

¹³³ See VALUES IN A TIME OF UPHEAVAL, *supra* note 61, at 154 (criticizing emphasis on population control at "the great conferences on world climate.").

¹³⁴ See *id.* at 28, in which he asks, "[t]he triad 'peace, justice, and preservation of creation' is universally recognized, but its contents remain completely vague. What serves the cause of peace? What is justice? How are we to preserve creation in the best possible way?"

¹³⁵ FAITH AND THE FUTURE, *supra* note 42, at 104. See also JOSEPH CARDINAL RATZINGER, THE NATURE AND MISSION OF THEOLOGY 81 (TRANS: ADRIAN WALKER) (1995) ("[T]he Church . . . cannot and must not become a political party.").

¹³⁶ Pope Benedict XVI, *Letter of His Holiness Pope Benedict to the President of the Commission for Religious Relations with the Jews on the Occasion of the 40th Anniversary of the Declaration "Nostra Aetate,"* October 26, 2005.

the ecological issues that will garner Pope Benedict XVI's attention will be those that fit into this framework of priorities. There are a few possibilities that emerge. The first, as mentioned previously, is the need to address the ecological devastation that is caused by warfare.¹³⁷ The second is the traditional intervention of the Holy See when issues of population control inevitably arise in international discussions about ecology.¹³⁸ The third is the high profile question of global climate change. That issue has risen to prominence in the secular world of ecology, and, thus, it may spark more extensive papal commentary.¹³⁹

Other possibilities that may confront Pope Benedict XVI include:

- aftermath of millennial debt forgiveness and the impact, if any, that this had has in the ability of impoverished nations to develop more secure food supplies via environmentally sustainable means;¹⁴⁰

¹³⁷ Indeed, Pope Benedict XVI alluded to this in his 2006 *Urbi et Orbi* Easter Message, in which he prayed, "concerning the international crises linked to nuclear power, may an honourable solution be found for all parties, through serious and honest negotiations, and may the leaders of nations and of international organizations be strengthened in their will to achieve peaceful coexistence among different races, cultures, and religions, in order to remove the threat of terrorism." Pope Benedict XVI, *Urbi et Orbi Message of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI*, Rome, April 16, 2006. See also Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI at the Conclusion of the Recitation of the Holy Rosary*, Rome, May 1, 2006 (speaking of the "need to convert to God, to God who is Love, so that the world may be freed from war and terrorism.").

¹³⁸ Indeed, Pope Benedict XVI has recently discussed the demographic situation of the 21st century in terms quite different from those found in the usual analysis of population growth. See Pope Benedict XVI, *Letter of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Participants in the Twelfth Plenary Assembly of the Pontifical Academy of the Social Science*, April 27, 2006:

While the statistics of population growth are indeed open to varying interpretations, there is general agreement that we are witnessing on a planetary level, and in the developed countries in particular, two significant and interconnected trends: on the one hand, an increase in life expectancy, and, on the other, a decrease in birth rates. As societies are growing older, many nations or groups of nations lack a sufficient number of young people to renew their population.

¹³⁹ As discussed in note 3, *supra*, the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace will be studying the link between climate change and development at an international conference in April 2007.

¹⁴⁰ Pope Benedict XVI has already referred to this problem when he discussed "the Holy See's efforts to contribute to finding effective solutions to some of the more significant problems facing the international community in recent years, such as the scandal of continued widespread hunger, grave illness and poverty in large areas of our world." Pope Benedict XVI, *Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to H.E. Mr. Francis Rooney, New Ambassador of the United States of America to the Holy See*, November 12,

- international trade agreements and their intended and unintended environmental consequences as economic globalization advances; and
- ecumenical activities in the environmental realm.

Finally, it will be interesting to observe how Pope Benedict XVI addresses ecological concerns in his public writing, and whether these issues become the subject of any major encyclicals, or whether they are addressed more frequently via Vatican interventions in secular environmental conferences.

V. Conclusion

Pope Benedict XVI has, in the past, proven himself to be a very eloquent writer in praise of the natural world and all its goodness. As his papacy unfolds, the development of these early themes will be intriguing to follow. He has written, with much optimism that the Church “must arouse the voice of the cosmos itself, making it, too, glorious, beautiful, habitable, and beloved,”¹⁴¹ because, in his words:

Christian belief knows no absolute separation between spirit and matter, between God and matter. . . . The assumption of the cosmos, of matter, into the relationship with God is thus a confession of the Creator God and of the world as creation, of the oneness bestowed on all reality by the Creator Spiritus. It also forms a link between the Christian faith and the religions of the nations which, as cosmic religions, seek God in the elements of the world and are actually on his trail, albeit at a distance. It is, at the same time, an expression of hope for the transformation of the cosmos.¹⁴²

To those who fear what may come next, he reassuringly professes that “God does not allow any part of his creation to sink silently into a past that has gone forever. He has created everything so that it should exist . . . he has created everything so that all should be one and should belong to him.”¹⁴³

2005. He went on to note, “An adequate approach to these issues cannot be limited to purely economic or technical considerations, but demands broad vision, practical solidarity and courageous long-term decisions with regard to complex ethical questions: among the latter I think especially of the effects of the crushing debt that feeds the spiral of poverty in many less developed nations.” *Id.*

¹⁴¹ THE RATZINGER REPORT, *supra* note 71, at 129 (quoting earlier comment of Cardinal Ratzinger in *Das Fest des Glaubens*). See also TRUTH AND TOLERANCE, *supra* note 28, at 127 (urging “re-entry into the dance of the cosmos through ecstasy.”).

¹⁴² PRINCIPLES OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY, *supra* note 47, at 29.

¹⁴³ SEEK THAT WHICH IS ABOVE, *supra* note 27, at 36.