

THE METAPHYSICS OF *CARITAS IN VERITATE*: AUGUSTINIAN THEOLOGY AND SOCIAL THOUGHT AS AN INTERPRETIVE KEY

Michael J. Ruszala

An aspect particularly striking about Caritas in Veritate among social encyclicals is its emphasis from the beginning on Augustinian-based metaphysics. This paper considers Pope Benedict's metaphysical starting point as a key contribution to social doctrine in times marked by the concrete embodiment of globalization, to which the postmodern mind has responded with increased secularism and religious indifferentism. Pope Benedict is seeking to guide globalization by man's rediscovery of himself via a metaphysics open to faith. Such a metaphysics reveals man's essentially relational character, intimating the unity in diversity of the Trinity, by whose power in charity lies the only lasting hope of human progress and development: not merely the peace of the earthly city but the city of God in its heavenly fulfillment. Broad as it is deep, Caritas in Veritate applies its metaphysics to social virtue in action in a variety of social concerns relevant to our contemporary world and society.

In his first social encyclical, *Caritas in Veritate*, Pope Benedict brings the social doctrine of the Church into dialogue with our contemporary globalized and pluralistic society. Globalization, first seen on the horizon in the social teaching of Pope John XXIII and Pope Paul VI, is now concretely instantiated and unraveling in our world, bringing with it unprecedented challenges and opportunities. Our world is now interconnected and interdependent especially because of its networks of communication and transportation, and this has strongly impacted philosophy, politics, and culture. "Diversity" has been the mantra in America for some time, but even Europe has become a melting pot of various peoples, cultures, and religions. Predisposed by the Enlightenment, the postmodern mind tends to respond to religious pluralism with indifferentism and increased secularism. Complicating the matter, the postmodern mind looks to itself to find the principles of meaning, yet its diverse subjective principles are inadequate to provide the foundation for true unity in our globalized world.

In the midst of this new act on the world stage enters Pope Benedict's *Caritas in Veritate*, an encyclical noted for a philosophical and metaphysical depth unfamiliar to many of its contemporary readers. Metaphysics in the encyclical serves to ground social thought in human

nature as opened up to God—a standard that places man within a framework larger than himself. Soon after the encyclical's publication, pundits began extracting statements from the encyclical and debating which side of the political spectrum could claim the document as their own. Thus the encyclical has often been misinterpreted and the implications of its prophetic and magisterial message of charity in truth risk becoming either trivialized or overlooked; it is important that Catholics with an understanding of philosophy and social doctrine clarify, embody, and share this message.

It is well known that Pope Benedict is an Augustinian and therefore no surprise that the Holy Father speaks, at key points in the message of *Caritas in Veritate*, in terms derived from Augustine. This article will explore the Holy Father's core intention in *Caritas in Veritate* from the perspective of Augustinian-based metaphysical theology—something that, albeit unfamiliar, he proposes to the contemporary world as a ground for the aspirations of our diverse society and as a guide in the midst of the errors of secularism and religious indifferentism. Such a metaphysic, following Augustine, is one that seeks the deeper principles of existence in God and by God's help for a fundamental understanding of man and the universe. We will first look at the sources of Pope Benedict's thought in Augustine and recent papal social teaching, then at the role and appropriateness of metaphysics as a ground for social thought, and finally at the Holy Father's application of metaphysics for social thought and for social virtue in action.

Sources of Thought: A Society Moved by Charity

The key message of *Caritas in Veritate* is that of charity in truth, and yet unpacking this simple phrase involves mysteries beyond unaided human understanding. The encyclical begins with these words: "Charity in truth, to which Jesus Christ bore witness by his earthly life and especially by his death and resurrection, is the principal driving force behind the authentic development of every person and of all humanity."¹ As we will see, charity in truth springs from the life of the Trinity, the paradigm of unity in diversity. Christ is our model, and also the one in whom we live charity in truth by way of the life of grace both as individuals and as a society. Authentic human development ultimately comes through charity because God is man's true end. Further, supernatural charity subsumes all other virtues, thus bringing holistic redemption and progress. The natural virtue of social justice, via the principles of solidarity and subsidiarity, directs all the virtues to the common good, which, as Pope John XXIII says, is the sum of "all those

social conditions which favor the full development of human personality.”² Affirming that “charity is at the heart of the Church’s social doctrine,” Pope Benedict is thus affirming a supernatural virtue and thus sanctification as the basis of social action.³ He writes, “...practising charity in truth helps people to understand that adhering to the values of Christianity is not merely useful but essential for building a good society and for true integral human development.”⁴ This is a radical statement in light of the increased secularization of society. It is tied up with Pope Benedict’s goal, which concurs with Augustine’s notion of the city of God whose peace stretches beyond that of this passing earthly city. The message of *Caritas in Veritate* comes together in an understanding of gratuitousness. We are gifts to be given and others are gifts to us. The greatest gift of all is God himself, thus we cannot isolate ourselves. Our very definition involves others; thus we must share and realize how we already give and receive without counting the cost.

Supernatural charity as the driving force of development in society at large can be understood in Augustinian terms. Pope Benedict writes, “In an increasingly globalized society, the common good and the effort to obtain it cannot fail to assume the dimensions of the whole human family... in such a way as to shape the earthly city in unity and peace, rendering it to some degree an anticipation and a prefiguration of the undivided city of God.”⁵ Here the Holy Father is referring to Augustine’s central concept in *De Civitate Dei*, a work in which Augustine places the history of the Roman Empire in the light of the metaphysical and transcendent realities that ground it. For Augustine, the earthly community is made up of the citizens of a more fundamental allegiance based on the orientation of their values: those of the city of God and those of the city of man. He writes, “Accordingly, two cities have been formed by two loves: the earthly by the love of self, even to the contempt of God; the heavenly by the love of God, even to the contempt of self.”⁶ Charity is the driving force of the city of God while the city of man is scattered in various directions by self-love. The citizens of the city of God and of the city of man converge in their desire for peace in the earthly city, but they do so with very different motivations. The former desires it as a means to the end of eternal peace while the city of man seeks only this and in the end loses eternal peace.⁷

While Pope Benedict does not mention the city of man directly, its self-seeking orientation contrasts with his message of gratuitousness and call for a civilization of love. Though recognizing that earthly peace comes through justice and solidarity, Pope Benedict calls his readers on to the supernatural charity of the city of God.⁸ Likewise Augustine

writes, “This heavenly city, then, while it sojourns on earth, calls citizens out of all nations, and gathers together a society of pilgrims of all languages... recognizing that, however various these are, they all tend to one and the same end of earthly peace.”⁹ In fact, earthly peace is brought more truly and perfectly when ordered by charity to eternal peace. This is because grace builds on nature, noting that the city of man is the community of those succumbing to fallen nature while the city of God is the community of those whose nature is elevated by grace.

Still Augustine, like Pope Benedict, awaits no earthly utopia because the hope of the city of God lies ultimately in heaven, beyond the workings of fallen humanity.¹⁰ The focus is not on the success of our action but on the virtue in which we grow. Aidan Nichols, O.P., writes, “Augustine’s notion of charity is, as Erich Przywara pointed out, far removed from an activist concept of the same. In charity Augustine saw, beyond all the ‘urgencies of action’, what Przywara terms ‘the free festivity of love’. Charity is the breath from on high of the eternal Sabbath, perceptible in all the active mission of the *civitas Dei*.”¹¹ Augustine measures the progress of the city of God by growth in faith, hope, and especially charity rather than in the success of our actions in the world. Likewise Pope Benedict is careful to distinguish authentic and holistic progress from mere material or technological progress, which needs to be guided by wisdom. He speaks of human development as a vocation. It is something that God has called us to and that we cannot reach without growing in charity. He writes, “To regard development as a vocation is to recognize, on the one hand, that it derives from a transcendent call, and on the other hand that it is incapable, on its own, of supplying its ultimate meaning.”¹² A virtuous person would not neglect action, but a person without virtue is not free to contribute to the city of God.

While Augustine is an evident source for *Caritas in Veritate*, the encyclical also stands clearly within the tradition of papal social encyclicals, particularly those following the Second Vatican Council, as Benedict clarifies and reapplies their teaching to the current day.¹³ He speaks of human rights—the right to life, the rights of workers, etc.—but speaks of rights as grounded in responsibilities rather than as the whim of a democratic body. This discussion on rights seems to be a clarification of the doctrine of John XXIII in *Pacem in Terris*. Benedict’s support of organized labor harkens back to Leo XIII’s *Rerum Novarum*. His incorporation of life issues and the family into social doctrine, his teaching on man and woman as “gift,” and his doctrine on faith and reason are reminiscent of the teachings of John Paul II. Most prominently, Pope Benedict dedicates the first chapter of *Caritas in*

Veritate to Pope Paul VI's *Populorum Progressio*, an encyclical that became a landmark in papal social teaching for its teaching on the fundamental concept of human development and was remembered for its practical language encouraging social action in the Church.¹⁴

Yet as Drew Christiansen, S.J., points out, *Caritas in Veritate*, while standing within the papal social tradition, is also markedly different from other social encyclicals.¹⁵ For example, while recalling *Populorum Progressio*, clarifying it, and drawing from its principles on human development, Pope Benedict's own encyclical most noticeably differs in its more philosophical language, such as that more commonly found in the likes of John Paul's *Fides et Ratio*, *Veritatis Splendor*, or his own *Deus Caritas Est*.¹⁶ It seems that this is part of his clarification of *Populorum Progressio* and his own overall program for our times. Whereas Pope Paul VI had presupposed philosophy and metaphysics but chose to speak to the times in more practical terms, our postmodern society has tended to abandon the speculative quest for who man is and who he must become in favor of practical action and effectiveness. In fact, in *Caritas in Veritate*, Pope Benedict explicitly draws out Pope Paul's underlying understanding of the world's need for metaphysics.¹⁷

Augustinian Metaphysics as a Ground for Social Thought

Christiansen, seeing this shift in Pope Benedict's social thought toward the metaphysical as contrasted from previous post-conciliar narrative models, shows concern that this style will lose many readers and thus fail to convey his important message of gratuitousness. He writes, "Benedict XVI's repeated appeal to metaphysics, as important as it is to his own theology and to his social message, seems to return to an earlier deductive model of teaching on social questions, a model abandoned by Vatican II's move to the symbolic rhetorical style of positive theology and reading the signs of the times in its social teaching."¹⁸ Christiansen further cites *Dei Verbum* paragraph 23, which encourages ministers to lay the Word of God before the people, as the key text of this movement towards salvation-historical thought.¹⁹ However, Matthew Levering argues that, while the Reformers saw metaphysics as a Greek element foreign and superadded to the Gospel, St. Thomas and the Fathers had derived their metaphysics from Scripture itself. He writes that Scripture, speaking of God, man, and the higher principles, makes statements, though in a narrative form, which could be truly called metaphysical.²⁰ Likewise, Augustine's understanding of history is not divorced from metaphysics but brings the eternal to light in the temporal. In his "Regensburg Address," Pope Benedict speaks of

Greek philosophy as a purification of thought and as a triumph of reason over superstition.²¹ Greek philosophy influenced the articulation of Scripture and further aided in its explanation through the councils of the Church. Thus he writes, “the fundamental decisions made about the relationship between faith and the use of human reason are part of the faith itself; they are developments consonant with the nature of faith itself.”²² Pope Benedict (then Fr. Ratzinger) was influential in the drafting of *Dei Verbum*.²³ Certainly the Council’s intention there and elsewhere was not to discard metaphysics but to emphasize and show forth the Word of God, which is further seen by metaphysics itself.

For Pope Benedict, metaphysics is necessary for human development. He writes, “The excessive segmentation of knowledge, the rejection of metaphysics by the human sciences, the difficulties encountered by dialogue between science and theology are damaging not only to the development of knowledge, but also to the development of peoples, because these things make it harder to see the integral good of man in its various dimensions.”²⁴ Authentic progress and development build up the whole person in freedom and in their community. This comes about through love, and authentic love is grounded in the truth. Pope Benedict warns of false progress, as seen when wealthy countries export abortion to less fortunate countries as if this were “progress.”²⁵ He also distinguishes authentic progress from the progress of technology. Globalization is also making “progress,” and in itself, globalization “is neither good nor bad,” but we must submit the actual effects of globalization to a “process of discernment.”²⁶ Metaphysics is key to this discernment. The truths of metaphysics ground the truths of finite sciences at work in history and also prepare for the assent of faith given to revelation while in turn being purified and strengthened by it. A purely historical worldview divorced from metaphysics can lead to cultural relativism.

Understanding the unchanging truths of metaphysics is indispensable to the life of the Church. The principles of metaphysics are implicit in pre-philosophical experience as grounding truth, but the philosophical study of metaphysics is certainly not possible for all. Faith reveals to us truths relevant to it which are knowable by reason but only with difficulty, thus the realities expressed by metaphysics are found embedded in Scripture.²⁷ Further, an understanding of the truths expressed by metaphysics can be found in the infused lights given to contemplatives, even if they lack philosophical education or articulation.²⁸ Yet metaphysics as a philosophical discipline testifies to these truths, thus transcending time in a way that the finite sciences cannot do. Further, it enables us to recognize the nature of these truths

when intimated through those finite sciences or even in Scripture or theology.

By metaphysics, Pope Benedict does not mean a discipline working from pure reason. Certainly for Augustine this is not the case. For Augustine, there was not yet a distinction between faith and reason; the distinction lay rather between the Christian scholar and the pagan scholar, where the Christian scholar had the full benefit of both (what we would call) faith and reason.²⁹ Following *Fides et Ratio*, Pope Benedict speaks of the purification of reason by faith and the purification of faith by reason.³⁰ Faith purified by reason is faith that seeks understanding and trusts in the full compatibility of faith and reason as coming from the same Source. In *Fides et Ratio*, John Paul II says that faith further impels reason to seek those truths accessible to it but which it might not have otherwise sought.³¹ Thus in *Caritas in Veritate*, Pope Benedict calls for a “broadening [of] our concept of reason and its application.”³² If society is going to progress in bringing about the common good that promotes the full flourishing of the human person in his totality, then society needs to be grounded in reason purified and impelled by faith—and even by faith purified by reason.

Augustinian metaphysics cannot be caricatured as pure reason deducing static causal principles; it is a process in which the mind is guided by the Teacher, the Source of all truth, toward the higher principles of being which ground all else.³³ According to Ilia Delio, O.S.F., metaphysics for St. Bonaventure, Pope Benedict’s favorite Augustinian, “begins with the consideration of the principles that govern particular, created substances, moving from that level to the consideration of the universal and uncreated and to the very notion of being.”³⁴ Delio points out that for Bonaventure, as for Augustine, metaphysics is markedly theological since the first principle, which is the term and source of metaphysics, is identified with the Person of the *Logos*.³⁵ Augustine speaks of the Light that enlightens all in the *Confessions*:

Yet they cried out ‘Truth, Truth,’ and spake much thereof to me, yet it was not in them: but they spake falsehood, not of Thee only (who truly art Truth), but even of those elements of this world, Thy creatures.... O Truth, Truth, how inwardly did even then the marrow of my soul pant after Thee, when they often and diversely, and in many and huge books, echoed of Thee to me, though it was but an echo?³⁶

Hence while many have knowledge, only those who are able to trace the principles of being back to the *Logos* himself, have true wisdom.³⁷ Given this unity of all things in the *Logos* in Augustinian thought, we see how Pope Benedict's vision for society is one that requires supernatural faith.

Pope Benedict writes, "Because it is filled with truth, charity can be understood in the abundance of its values, it can be shared and communicated."³⁸ Opening our minds to Truth in the created truth of things brings us to love with charity, by which we are given to love all things for God's sake and to love God in all things. Charity in truth leads people to go beyond themselves and their "subjective opinions."³⁹ It leads to the fundamental notion of the gratuitousness of human life. He writes, "The human being is made for gift, which expresses and makes present his transcendent dimension... It takes first place in our souls as a sign of God's presence in us, a sign of what he expects from us. Truth—which is itself gift, in the same way as charity—is greater than we are, as Saint Augustine teaches."⁴⁰ Gratuitousness is close to the heart of Pope Benedict's message of charity in truth. We are given to ourselves by God as a gift to be given. Others are a gift for us. The greatest gift of all is God who gave himself to us, and he likewise gives himself as Truth. This Truth grounds our charity, which, as grace, is also not our own. Thus we are essentially dependent on God and interdependent on others.

Delio writes, "Since charity necessarily involves a relation to one another, there can be no charity where there is no plurality..."⁴¹ Thus in *Caritas in Veritate*, Pope Benedict calls upon metaphysics to show that man, like the Trinity his Source, is essentially relational, thus grounding the concept of gratuity so central to his social message. He writes of the understanding of human solidarity, "Thinking of this kind requires a deeper critical evaluation of the category of relation. This is a task that cannot be undertaken by the social sciences alone, insofar as the contribution of disciplines such as metaphysics and theology is needed if man's transcendent dignity is to be properly understood."⁴² The Persons of the Trinity, the Source of charity in truth, are defined relationally to one another. Bonaventure, drawing from Pseudo-Dionysius, sees this as a self-diffusive out-pouring of the Good from the Father to the Son, whose union in Love produces the Holy Spirit.⁴³

Likewise, it seems Pope Benedict is saying that human persons are to be metaphysically defined relationally both before God and others. The highest unity of all is seen in diversity—the Trinity—and in charity we are called into this love. Pope Benedict recalls that Christ prayed in Jn 17:22 "that they may be one even as we are one."⁴⁴ He

further writes, “Just as a family does not submerge the identities of its individual members... so too the unity of the human family does not submerge the identities of individuals, peoples and cultures, but makes them more transparent to each other and links them more closely in their legitimate diversity.”⁴⁵ By the bonds of charity, all humanity must come together in truth without losing itself. Thus the Holy Father denounces both “cultural eclecticism,” which draws from different cultures as if it were itself outside of its own culture, and “cultural leveling,” which accepts virtually any lifestyle in the view that the meaning of humanity simply changes with various cultures. He writes, “What eclecticism and cultural leveling have in common is the separation of culture from human nature. Thus, cultures can no longer define themselves within a nature that transcends them, and man ends up being reduced to a mere cultural statistic.”⁴⁶ The Holy Father affirms that cultures rightly converge on fundamental points of contact that transcend culture itself, and metaphysics is needed to help discern the human nature that lies behind all culture.

Social Application Grounded in Charity in Truth

Whereas the beginning of the encyclical led us into metaphysical depth, it may seem surprising that the remaining chapters are concerned with practical matters regarding the contemporary social environment. George Weigel argues that many of the practical applications in the encyclical come from the agenda of the Pontifical Council on Justice and Peace while other lines in the document continue more traditional papal social thought and that therefore the encyclical is a composite of two lines of thought which cannot be fully reconciled.⁴⁷ It seems that even if certain points were recommended by the Pontifical Council according to their line of thought, the shift from metaphysics to practical concern is precisely the point Pope Benedict intends to make. Perhaps it is both a key to their interpretation as well as a model for others engaged in social thought.

The key principle behind Pope Benedict’s social application is the holistic development by charity in truth of human persons essentially in relation to God and each other, as grounded in his Augustinian metaphysics. Here we will look at a brief sampling of how the Holy Father applies his metaphysical thought. Life is a fundamental requirement of justice, and thus certainly charity. Concerning life issues Pope Benedict writes, “One of the most striking aspects of development in the present day is the important question of *respect for life*, which cannot in any way be detached from questions concerning the

development of peoples.” He continues that it is now “obliging us to broaden our concept of poverty and underdevelopment...”⁴⁸ It is absurd to speak of concern for human development on one hand while promoting abortion and thus committing a grave injustice on the other, and yet this is common. Such a one-sided program of development actually introduces new forms of poverty: the spiritual poverty of abortion and a lack of welcome for new generations who should be seen as an asset and not a burden, even in the marketplace.⁴⁹

Thus the Holy Father further carries the concept of human development into the marketplace. He promotes a stakeholder-focused model over one that only considers shareholders in the distribution of profits.⁵⁰ He also promotes a specific trend in the market of enterprises that cannot fit into either the categories of public or private but exist for the sake of human interests.⁵¹ Christiansen writes, “This second model originated with the late Chiara Lubich and the Focolare movement, which now counts more than 700 firms built along these lines.”⁵² Pope Benedict calls for recognizing and promoting gratuitousness in the marketplace, since not even the market is separated from man who is an essentially relational being.⁵³

Pope Benedict writes, “*Nature expresses a design of love and truth,*” perhaps having in mind the thought of St. Bonaventure on material creation as a vestige of God.⁵⁴ He writes, “when ‘human ecology’ is respected within society, environmental ecology also benefits.”⁵⁵ Concern for creation must include a greater concern for man who was given dominion over it. The human common good includes in it the good of the environment for man’s use and enjoyment, but without ever placing the environment above man’s own needs. However, in this view, we must recognize that “every violation of solidarity and civic friendship harms the environment, just as environmental deterioration in turn upsets relations in society.”⁵⁶

Further, if charity in truth is the driving force of the city of God leading ultimately to heaven, works promoting human development bear witness to this. Thus, practicing the social doctrine of the Church is itself part of the work of evangelization, though one must also be ready to give an account for one’s hope as well. Quoting Paul VI in *Evangelii Nuntiandi*, Pope Benedict writes, “evangelization would not be complete if it did not take account of the unceasing interplay of the Gospel and of man’s concrete life, both personal and social.”⁵⁷ Thus the Holy Father links holistic development with true liberation, awaiting the fullness of the kingdom of God, which will be realized not on earth but in heaven.⁵⁸

Conclusion

A key contribution of *Caritas in Veritate* is its grounding in Augustinian metaphysics as a source for social doctrine leading to social virtue in action. Our postmodern society has within it a longing for unity in its celebration of diversity. Yet it often pursues that unity via the love of the city of man, a love that can only end in disunity and the victory of special interests over the common good. Our society values scholarly reflection to further the development of peoples, but it limits this reflection to finite empirical sciences which are very helpful in their own competency but which can never supplant metaphysics, which should ground their analysis in the transcendent reality of who man is before God and in relation to his fellow man. Augustinian metaphysics emphasizes that metaphysics is not merely an abstract discipline but a walk with Truth himself, the Teacher who shows man God and shows man to himself. It emphasizes that the transcendent reality of man is played out for good or for evil on the stage of world history, and that the side fully favoring human development is the one that opens itself to the supernatural virtue of charity with aim to the fulfillment of the city of God in eternity. Virtue and sanctification, therefore, become central to social thought, but virtue lends itself to action. Hence metaphysics becomes fruitful in promoting the peace of the earthly city while ordering it and summoning it beyond to the glory of God.

Notes

1. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, June 29, 2009, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/benedict_xvi/encyclicals/documents/hf_b-en-xvi_enc_20090629_caritas-in-veritate_en.html (accessed April 11, 2010), no. 1.
2. Pius XI, *Quadragesimo Anno*, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/pius_xi/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-xi_enc_19310515_quadragesimo-anno_en.html (accessed April 18, 2010), no. 101 on social justice seen as a virtue; John XXIII, *Mater et Magistra*, May 15, 1961, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_xxiii/encyclicals/documents/hf_j-xxiii_enc_15051961_mater_en.html (accessed April 18, 2010), no. 65 on the common good.
3. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 2.
4. Ibid., no. 4.
5. Ibid., no. 7.
6. Augustine of Hippo (354-430) *De Civitate Dei*, trans. Marcus Dods, *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers*, First Series, vol. 2., ed. Philip Schaff (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1956) 14.28 § 856.
7. Ibid. 19.26 § 1083.
8. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 6.
9. Ibid. 19.17 § 1073.
10. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 14.
11. Aidan Nichols, O.P., *The Thought of Pope Benedict XVI: An Introduction to the Theology of Joseph Ratzinger*, New Edition (London: Burns & Oates, 2007), 33.
12. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 16.
13. Drew Christiansen, S.J., "Metaphysics and Society: A Commentary on *Caritas in Veritate*," *Theological Studies* 71, no. 1 (2010): 5.
14. Ibid., 8.
15. Ibid., 7.
16. Ibid., 6.
17. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 53.
18. Ibid., 7.
19. Footnote on Ibid.; Second Vatican Council, *Dei Verbum*, no. 23, in *Vatican Council II, Volume 1: The Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, ed. Austin Flannery, O.P., new rev. ed., (Northport, New York: Costello Publishing Company, 2004).
20. Matthew Levering, *Scripture and Metaphysics: Aquinas and the Renewal of Trinitarian Theology* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), 5.

21. Benedict XVI, "Regensburg: University Address," September 12, 2006, <http://www.ewtn.com/library/papaldoc/b16bavaria11.htm> (accessed May 17, 2010).
22. Ibid.
23. Ralph M. Wiltgen, S.V.D., *The Rhine Flows into the Tiber: A History of Vatican II* (Rockford, Illinois: Tan Books and Publishers, Inc., 1985), 176.
24. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 31.
25. Ibid., no. 28.
26. Ibid., no. 42.
27. Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274) *Summa Theologica*, trans. Fathers of the English Dominican Province, 1920, <http://newadvent.org/summa/1001.htm#article1> (accessed April 18, 2010) 1.1.1.
28. Levering, 31.
29. Benedict J. Groeschel, C.F.R., *Augustine: Major Writings, The Crossroad Spiritual Legacy Series* (New York: Crossroad Publishing Co., 1996), 43.
30. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 56.
31. Ibid., no. 76.
32. Ibid., no. 31.
33. Augustine of Hippo (354-430) *De Magistro*, trans. J. H. S. Burleigh, *Augustine: Earlier Writings*, ed. J. H. S. Burleigh, (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 1953) 12.39-40 § 96-97.
34. Ilia Delio, O.S.F., "Bonaventure's Metaphysics of the Good," *Theological Studies*, 60, no. 2 (1999): 230.
35. Ibid., 245.
36. Augustine of Hippo (354-430) *Confessiones*, trans. Edward Bouverie Pusey (Middlesex, TX: Echo Library, 2006) 3 § 187.
37. Delio, 243.
38. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 4.
39. Ibid.
40. Ibid., no. 34.
41. Delio, 132.
42. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 53.
43. Delio, 232.
44. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 54.
45. Ibid., no. 53.
46. Ibid., no. 26.
47. George Weigel, "Caritas in Veritate in Gold and Red," *National Review Online*, July 7, 2009, <http://article.nationalreview.com/399362/icaritas-in-veritatei-in-gold-and-red/george-weigel> (accessed April 11, 2010).

48. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 28.
49. Ibid., no. 44.
50. Ibid., 40.
51. Ibid., no. 41.
52. Christiansen, 21.
53. Benedict XVI, *Caritas in Veritate*, no. 43.
54. Ibid., no. 48.
55. Ibid., no. 51.
56. Ibid.
57. Ibid., no. 15.
58. Ibid.